

# HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REMOTE ONLINE MEETING June 30, 2021 ROOM 267 + WebEx

#### **MINUTES**

**MEMBERS PRESENT:** Ms. Kim Parati (Chairperson)

Mr. PJ Henningson (Vice Chairperson)

Ms. Jessica Hindman (2nd Vice Chairperson)

Mr. Chris Barth

Ms. Nichelle Bonaparte

Mr. Jim Haden

Ms. Christa Lineberger Mr. Damon Rumsch Ms. Jill Walker

IVIS. JIII VVaikei

MEMBERS ABSENT: Mr. Chris Muryn

Vacant

OTHERS PRESENT: Ms. Kristi Harpst, Administrator of the Historic District

Ms. Candice Leite, Staff to the Historic District Commission Ms. Cindy Kochanek, Staff to the Historic District Commission Ms. Linda Keich, Clerk to the Historic District Commission Ms. Jill Sanchez-Myers, Senior Assistant City Attorney

Ms. Candy Thomas, Court Reporter

With a quorum present, Chairperson Parati called the June 30, 2021 remote online meeting at 1:18 p.m. Chairperson Parati began the meeting by introducing the Staff, the Commissioners, and explaining the meeting's procedure. Participants in today's evidentiary hearings were required to submit a copy of any presentation, document, exhibit or other material that they wished to submit at the evidentiary hearing prior to today's meeting. All such materials, as well as a copy of City staff's presentations and documents, were posted online prior to today's meeting. No case is proceeding today in which anyone contacted the City to object to the remote, online meeting platform. The review of each application consists of the Presentation of the application and Deliberation. The application is presented by the HDC staff. The Commission will first determine if there is enough information to proceed with the hearing. The applicant will present their testimony for the application. Other parties wishing to speak, for or against, will be given reasonable time to

present factual sworn testimony based on the HDC Design Guidelines. The HDC may question the applicant and HDC staff members. HDC staff and the applicant will be given an opportunity for rebuttal and final comments. The HDC shall close the hearing for discussion and deliberation. During discussion and deliberation only the Commission and staff may speak. An HDC member may request the hearing to be opened for further questioning. The HDC will craft a motion for Approval, Continuation, or Denial. The majority vote of the Commission present is required for a decision to be reached. A final vote by the HDC will end the hearing. Chairperson Parati asked that the following guidelines be followed during the meeting; mute your audio when you're not speaking. Use only one source of audio (computer or phone), do not put your phone on hold, make sure you are in a guiet area, please turn off or silent electronic devices and do not speak over the person talking or you will be asked to leave the meeting, use the "raise your hand" tool. Please do not speak unless recognized by the Chair or Staff. Because the Commission is a quasi-judicial body, any speaker FOR or AGAINST an application must be sworn in. Due to the hybrid nature of today's proceedings, any individual wishing to speak for or against an application was asked to sign-up and provide any additional evidence in advance of the meeting. During the hearing Chairperson Parati will further open the floor to anyone who has joined the meeting by telephone. Speakers will begin by stating their name and address. Chairperson Parati swore in all Applicants and Staff and continued to swear in people as they arrived for the duration of the meeting.

#### **INDEX OF ADRESSES:**

#### **NEW CASES**

HDCRMA 2021-00252, 325-331 East Boulevard HDCRMA 2021-00235, 1913 Cleveland Avenue

Dilworth Dilworth

## **NEW CASES**

## **ABSENT | RECUSE | LEFT | RETURNED:**

**ABSENT: MURYN** 

## **APPLICATION:**

HDCRMA 2021-00252, 325 AND 331 EAST BOULEVARD (PID: 12307506 & 12307507) – NEW CONSTRUCTION, MULTI-FAMILY

## **EXISTING CONDITIONS:**

325 East Boulevard was demolished in 2015. The former building was a "2 ½ Craftsman, frame. Broad side gabled block with exposed rafter ends, wood shingled on second and half stories, weather boarded below. Engaged porch on square posts on piers. Front gable projection with flanking shed dormers. Gabled entry. ca. 1915." The building was listed as a contributing structure in the Dilworth National Register of Historic Places.

331 East Boulevard was demolished in 2020. The former building was a "2.5 story apartment building with a side gable roof and triangular brackets. Two-tier full façade shed porch with brick piers on first floor, paired posts and shingled balustrade on second. Central gable with stucco and timbering, ca

1925." The building was listed as a contributing structure in the Dilworth National Register of Historic Places.

## PROPOSAL:

The proposal is new construction of a multi-family building located on two parcels at the corner of East Boulevard and Euclid Avenue. The new structure is approximately 34'-7 2/16" in height at the front elevation facing East Boulevard. The building steps up in height approximately 1/3 of the way back from the front façade to a height of approximately 41'- 0½". Proposed materials are partially called out on the details page, which notes wood siding with a 4" reveal and wood columns, trim, and porch rails. Windows proposed to be double-hung aluminum clad.

#### **STAFF ANALYSIS:**

Staff has the comments about the proposal:

- 1. The Commission will determine if the proposed project meets the design guidelines for new construction.
- 2. Height, Massing, Scale, Roof form (pitches appear a bit shallow for the Craftsman style).
- 3. Door design a single sidelight is incongruous.
- 4. Additional information is needed about proposed materials.
- 5. Landscape plan with required tree replanting is needed.
- 6. Site plan with HVAC & trash locations.

## **SPEAKERS [FOR | AGAINST]:**

Ms. Ellen Citarella, neighborhood resident, spoke in opposition of this application.

Mr. Franklin Keathley, neighborhood resident, spoke in opposition of this application.

Mr. Kemper Boyd, neighborhood resident, spoke in opposition of this application.

Ms. Haley Dugger, neighborhood resident, spoke in opposition of this application.

# MOTION: CONTINUED 1st: RUMSCH 2nd: HADEN

Mr. Rumsch moved to continue this application for the following: On the East Boulevard elevation, eliminate the fourth floor and for the building to respect the adjacent heights of foundation level, cornice level, and roof level of the adjacent buildings. That includes the steps from the front yard to the street and from the yard to the floor. That's from Chapter 6.9, Chapter 6.3, and Chapter 8.4. A restudy of the front porch details, especially the details around the balcony railing, the roofing, and columns.

Provide a block site plan showing the new building and the adjacent setbacks of the buildings and positions of the buildings around it. Provide an elevation of East Boulevard three buildings to the right and three buildings to the left for context. Provide dimensions on that block site plan from the thermal wall to the street of the different buildings. With the site plan, provide a tree planting from the previous application. On Euclid Avenue, provide a restudy of the massing, the setback, the roof lines, the scale, and the height, as in Chapter 6, numbers 1. Other architectural details will be reviewed according to the changes that have been asked for. On the Euclid side, provide a connection between the front door and the sidewalk.

**VOTE**: 10/0 **AYES**: BARTH, BONAPARTE, GOODWIN, HADEN, HENNINGSON,

## HINDMAN, LINEBERGER, PARATI, RUMSCH, WALKER

**NAYS:** NONE

## **DECISION:**

APPLICATION FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION CONTINUED.

## ABSENT | RECUSE | LEFT | RETURNED:

ABSENT: MURYN LEFT: PARATI, 3:20 PM

#### **APPLICATION:**

HDCRMA 2021-00235, 1913 CLEVELAND AVENUE (PID: 12105619) - NEW CONSTRUCTION - MULTI FAMILY

## **EXISTING CONDITIONS:**

The existing structure is a one story, concrete block three-bay building. The c. 1960 building mentioned in the Dilworth National Register Nomination burnt down in the early 1990s. The current structure was built in 1993. The building has a shallow gable roof with a front parapet.

## **PROPOSAL**:

The proposal is new construction of a multi-family building. The new structure is approximately 44' in height from grade to the top of the decorative parapet (three stories) at the front elevation on Cleveland Avenue and four-stories at the rear of the building, due to site topography. Exterior materials are brick, cast stone, and aluminum clad windows. Setback is 20' from back of curb and 6'-6 ½" from back of property line. A full-width 9' deep front porch faces Cleveland Avenue. HVAC units will be located on the roof.

#### **STAFF ANALYSIS:**

Staff has the following comments about the proposal:

- 1. The Commission will determine if the proposed project meets the design guidelines for new construction.
- 2. Landscaping details (tree removal/planting, walkways, hardscape, etc.) are needed.

#### **SPEAKERS [FOR | AGAINST]:**

Mr. Ken Raynor, neighborhood resident, spoke in opposition of this application.

Mr. Rick Cohan, neighborhood resident, spoke in opposition of this application.

## MOTION: CONTINUED 1<sup>st</sup>: BARTH 2<sup>nd</sup>: RUMSCH

Mr. Barth moved to continue this application for the applicant to provide additional study options of the rear portion of the building regarding massing. The applicant to provide additional context with some of the historic structures within a 360-degree range, including the properties directly behind them. The applicant to provide accurate and clear drawings that are visible, providing adequate architectural details as well as dimensions and notation.

Ms. Hindman made a friendly amendment needed are technical drawings and high-resolution images.

**VOTE:** 7/2 **AYES:** BARTH, BONAPARTE, GOODWIN, HADEN, HENNINGSON,

HINDMAN, RUMSCH, **NAYS:** LINEBERGER, WALKER

# **DECISION**:

APPLICATION FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION – MULTI-FAMILY CONTINUED.

With no further business to discuss, Mr. Henningson recessed the meeting at 5:00 PM.

Linda Keich, Clerk to the Historic District Commission