

# The City of Charlotte Update Disparity Study

## FINAL REPORT



*September 26, 2011*

Submitted by:





---

Mr. Reginald Smith, Partner  
2123 Centre Pointe Blvd.  
Tallahassee, Florida 32308  
P: 850.386.3191  
F: 850.385.4501  
rsmith@mgtamer.com

September 26, 2011

CITY OF CHARLOTTE  
UPDATE DISPARITY STUDY  
FINAL REPORT

---

Submitted to:  
The City of Charlotte

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

	PAGE
1.0 INTRODUCTION.....	1-1
1.1 Background.....	1-1
1.2 Overview of Study Approach .....	1-1
1.3 Technical Approach .....	1-2
1.4 Report Organization.....	1-2
2.0 LEGAL REVIEW .....	2-1
2.1 Introduction .....	2-1
2.2 Standards of Review for Race-Specific and Gender-Specific Programs .....	2-2
2.3 To Withstand Strict Scrutiny, an MBE Program Must Be Based on Thorough Evidence Showing a Compelling Governmental Interest .....	2-3
2.4 Sufficiently Strong Evidence of Significant Statistical Disparities Between Qualified Minorities Available and Minorities Utilized Will Satisfy Strict Scrutiny and Justify a Narrowly Tailored M/WBE Program .....	2-5
2.5 The Governmental Entity or Agency Enacting an M/WBE Program Must Be Shown to Have Actively or Passively Perpetuated the Discrimination .....	2-8
2.6 Anecdotal Evidence of Discrimination in Disparity Studies.....	2-9
2.7 To Withstand Strict Scrutiny, an M/WBE Program Must Be Narrowly Tailored to Remedy Identified Discrimination .....	2-10
2.8 Small Business Procurement Preferences .....	2-12
2.9 Conclusions .....	2-14
3.0 MARKET AREA, UTILIZATION, AND AVAILABILITY ANALYSES.....	3-1
3.1 Methodology .....	3-1
3.2 Analysis of Subcontracting.....	3-10
3.3 Analysis of Prime Contracting - Construction .....	3-16
3.4 Analysis of Prime Consulting – Architecture and Engineering.....	3-19
3.5 Analysis of Prime Consulting – Professional Services.....	3-23
3.6 Analysis of Prime Consulting – Other Services .....	3-29
3.7 Analysis of Prime Consulting – Goods and Supplies.....	3-34
3.8 Procurement Card (P-Card) Transactions .....	3-39
3.9 City of Charlotte Small Business Opportunity (SBO) Program Analysis	3-40
3.10 Summary.....	3-53

## TABLE OF CONTENTS *(continued)*

---

4.0	DISPARITY ANALYSIS.....	4-1
4.1	Methodology .....	4-1
4.2	Disparity Indices.....	4-2
5.0	PRIVATE SECTOR UTILIZATION AND NON GOAL ANALYSIS.....	5-1
5.1	Methodology – Private Sector Commercial Construction Analysis .....	5-2
5.2	Collection and Management of Data.....	5-3
5.3	Private Sector Utilization Analysis by Race, Ethnicity, Gender of Business Ownership for Construction Prime and Subcontractors .....	5-5
5.4	Private Sector Availability Analysis by Race, Ethnicity, Gender of Business Ownership for Construction Contractors .....	5-11
5.5	Analysis of Disparities in Private Sector Utilization by Race, Ethnicity, Gender of Business Ownership for Construction Prime Contractors and Subcontractors.....	5-12
5.6	Establishing a Nexus between Commercial Construction Permitting and City of Charlotte Construction Public Projects .....	5-17
5.7	Comparison of the City of Charlotte Utilization with M/WBE Utilization in the Private Sector .....	5-17
5.8	Disparities in Construction, Professional Services, Other Services, and Goods and Supplies.....	5-20
5.9	Analysis of Self-Employment Propensity and Earnings of Race/ Ethnic/Gender Effects on Self-Employment Propensity.....	5-28
5.10	Conclusions .....	5-41
6.0	ANECDOTAL ANALYSIS .....	6-1
6.1	Methodology .....	6-1
6.2	Demographics .....	6-5
6.3	Barriers to Doing Business with the City.....	6-11
6.4	Small Business Opportunity Program .....	6-16
6.5	Prompt Payment .....	6-19
6.6	Access to Capital .....	6-19
6.7	Bonding and Insurance .....	6-20
6.8	Disparate Treatment and Discrimination.....	6-20
6.9	Other Noteworthy Comments .....	6-22
6.10	Suggested Remedies .....	6-23
6.11	Conclusion .....	6-24
7.0	FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS .....	7-1
7.1	Introduction .....	7-1
7.2	Legal Background.....	7-1
7.3	Findings for Subcontracting .....	7-2

## TABLE OF CONTENTS *(continued)*

---

7.0	FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (Continued) .....	7-1
7.4	Findings for Prime Contracting .....	7-8
7.5	Findings for Private Sector.....	7-15
7.6	Findings for Charlotte Programs and Policies.....	7-16
7.7	Commendations and Recommendations.....	7-18

### APPENDICES

Appendix A:	Disparity Study Announcement
Appendix B:	Public Hearing Announcement
Appendix C:	Survey of Vendors Instrument
Appendix D:	Survey of Vendors Results
Appendix E:	Survey of Vendors Regression Analysis
Appendix F:	Personal Interview Guide
Appendix G:	Focus Group Survey of Area Businesses
Appendix H:	Focus Group Guide
Appendix I:	Custom Census Survey
Appendix J:	Statistical Disparity in Small Business Credit Markets
Appendix K:	U.S. Census Survey of Business Owners Availability Estimates
Appendix L:	City of Charlotte CMSA (PUMS) Regression Analysis
Appendix M:	Market Area and Overall Utilization and Analysis by Business Category
Appendix N:	Selected Policies of other S/M/WBE Programs
Appendix O:	List of Trade Associations and Agencies Contacted for Vendor Lists
Appendix P:	Vendor Availability
Appendix Q:	Utilization Analysis for Construction at the Prime Level by Threshold Level

### GLOSSARY OF TERMS

## **1.0 INTRODUCTION**

---

## **2.0 LEGAL REVIEW**

---

### **3.0 MARKET AREA, UTILIZATION, AND AVAILABILITY ANALSES**

---



## **4.0 DISPARITY ANALYSIS**

---

**5.0 PRIVATE SECTOR  
UTILIZATION AND NON  
GOAL ANALYSIS**

---

## **6.0 ANECDOTAL ANALYSIS**

---

## ***7.0 FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS***

---

## ***APPENDICES***

---

***APPENDIX A:  
DISPARITY STUDY  
ANNOUNCEMENT***

---

**APPENDIX B:  
PUBLIC HEARING  
ANNOUNCEMENT**

---

***APPENDIX C:  
SURVEY OF VENDORS  
INSTRUMENT***

---



**APPENDIX D:  
SURVEY OF VENDORS RESULTS**

---

***APPENDIX E:  
SURVEY OF VENDORS  
REGRESSION ANALYSIS***

---

***APPENDIX F:  
PERSONAL INTERVIEW GUIDE***

---

***APPENDIX G:  
FOCUS GROUP SURVEY OF  
AREA BUSINESSES***

---

***APPENDIX H:  
FOCUS GROUP GUIDE***

---

***APPENDIX I:  
CUSTOM CENSUS SURVEY***

---

**APPENDIX J:  
STATISTICAL DISPARITY IN  
SMALL BUSINESS CREDIT  
MARKETS**

---

**APPENDIX K:  
U.S. CENSUS SURVEY OF  
BUSINESS OWNERS  
AVAILABILITY ESTIMATES**

---



**APPENDIX L:**

**CITY OF CHARLOTTE CMSA  
(PUMS) REGRESSION ANALYSIS**

***APPENDIX M:  
MARKET AREA AND OVERALL  
UTILIZATION AND ANALYSIS BY  
BUSINESS CATEGORY***

---

**APPENDIX N:  
SELECTED POLICIES OF OTHER  
S/M/WBE PROGRAMS**

---

**APPENDIX O:  
LIST OF TRADE ASSOCIATIONS  
AND AGENCIES CONTACTED  
FOR VENDOR LISTS**

---

***APPENDIX P:  
VENDORS AVAILABILITY***

---

**APPENDIX Q:  
UTILIZATION ANALYSIS FOR  
CONSTRUCTION AT THE  
PRIME LEVEL BY  
THRESHOLD LEVEL**

---