

Please see comparison chart below for staff’s evaluation of the multi-family collection contract proposals. This comparison was requested by City Council on December 11, 2017.

While both companies submitted qualified and detailed proposals, the City feels Waste Pro is best suited to meet the City’s operational and strategic goals. In service solicitations, the City is not required to award the lowest responsive bidder. The City may pursue the “best value for money”, a consideration which may include other factors, in addition to price. Republic Services provided over 20 years of successful waste service, and we value their partnership.

Multi-Family Collection Contract Proposals Comparison

Evaluation Criteria	Waste Pro of North Carolina	Republic Services												
Qualifications and Experience	Necessary qualifications and experience to perform the Services	Necessary qualifications and experience to perform the Services												
Equipment Age	Waste Pro’s proposal includes all new, environmentally-friendly equipment to use for this Project. The proposed equipment (i) supports the City Council’s Environment Focus Area Plan’s objectives through the practice of environmental stewardship and protecting air quality and (ii) promotes availability of equipment for timely service. Additionally, the proposed trucks will reduce fuel consumption and noise. See Collection Equipment Comparison chart.	Republic’s proposal includes equipment produced prior to 2007 that does not meet minimum EPA emissions standards for new vehicles. See Collection Equipment Comparison chart.												
Routing	Waste Pro highlighted that it had conducted an extensive, physical observation of current routes, equipment utilized and personnel allocation, leading to a solution that better balances the routes and will result in fewer pieces of equipment on the road negatively impacting the environment.	Republic’s proposal did not highlight any proposed changes to current routing. The current number of dumpster collections per day are unbalanced, which can cause issues with completing routes on assigned service days. <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Day</th> <th># Collections</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Mon</td> <td>882</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Tues</td> <td>682</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Wed</td> <td>153</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Thu</td> <td>239</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Fri</td> <td>284</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Day	# Collections	Mon	882	Tues	682	Wed	153	Thu	239	Fri	284
Day	# Collections													
Mon	882													
Tues	682													
Wed	153													
Thu	239													
Fri	284													
Financial Qualifications	Financial qualifications sufficient to meet the City’s needs	Financial qualifications sufficient to meet the City’s needs												

<p>Cost Effectiveness and Value</p>	<p>Waste Pro’s projected average annual contract cost for the three year contract term is approximately \$5.8M. This includes annual unit count growth. The Waste Pro proposal averages \$495K or 9% more than Republic’s proposal per year during the initial contract term.</p> <p>In the City’s observation of past performance of the contract, the City deemed Waste Pro’s offer of new equipment to be a vital factor to ensuring equipment availability and by extension helping to ensure on-time performance.</p> <p>Additionally, the proposal of all new, environmentally-friendly equipment supports environmental stewardship and reduces fuel consumption and noise.</p>	<p>Republic’s projected average annual contract cost for the three year contract term is approximately \$5.3M. This includes annual unit count growth. Republic’s proposal averages \$495K or 9% less than Waste Pro’s proposal per year during the initial contract term.</p> <p>In the City’s observation of past performance of the contract, Republic’s proposal of older equipment is a concern in ensuring equipment availability and by extension the ability to ensure on-time performance.</p>
<p>MWSBE Inclusion Efforts</p>	<p>Commitment to utilize MWSBE contractors to perform 15% of the value of the Services.</p>	<p>Proposal included 15% of the value of the services to be subcontracted. Recycling collection will be provided by an MWSBE contractor.</p>

Collection Equipment Comparison

Age	Republic Diesel	Republic Subcontractor Diesel*	Republic Total	Waste Pro Clean Diesel**	Waste Pro CNG	Waste Pro Total***
New	0	0	0	5	19	24
1 – 5 Years	9	0	9	0	0	0
6 -10 Years	8	0	8	0	0	0
11 – 15 Years	8		8	0	0	0
16+ Years	0	5	5	0	0	0
Total	25	5	30	5	19	24

*Two new trucks scheduled for 2018 and one new truck for 2019

**Equipped with the particulate system and on-board cameras. Vehicle hydraulic lines will be armored and utilize EnviroLogic hydraulic fluid, a non-hazardous and biodegradable product.

***Waste Pro provided a range of total equipment and will adjust resources dedicated to the Project after the re-balancing of routes.