The City Council of the City of Charlotte, North Carolina convened for an Action Review on Monday, November 25, 2019, at 5:05 p.m. in Room 267 of the Charlotte Mecklenburg Government Center with Mayor Vi Lyles presiding. Councilmembers present were Dimple Ajmera, Tariq Bokhari, Ed Driggs, Larken Egleston, LaWana Mayfield, Greg Phipps and Braxton Winston II.

ABSENT UNTIL NOTED: Councilmembers Julie Eiselt, Justen Harlow, Matt Newton and James Mitchell.

ITEM NO. 1: MAYOR AND COUNCIL CONSENT ITEM QUESTIONS

Mayor Lyles said Item No. 52 has been settled. Item No. 11 has been deferred to December 9th and Item Nos. 65 and 67 are deferred until our January meeting.

Councilmembers Newton and Eiselt arrived at 5:08 p.m.

Marie Harris, Shared Services Deputy Director said the sheet in front of you are all for Mr. Winston, and I did get a chance to go over these with him earlier.

ITEM NO. 2: AGENDA OVERVIEW

Marcus Jones, City Manager said we have three items on the Action Briefing; one is the Housing Program Summary in which Pam Wideman will give you a walk-through of a recent assessment that her Department has gone through for an item that will have a public hearing tonight. Federico Rios will talk a bit about where we are in terms of equity mobility and immigrant integration in terms of an update, and lastly, the City Clerk will present the draft, and I emphasize draft, of the 2020 Council Meeting Calendar.

ITEM NO. 3: HOUSING PROGRAMS SUMMARY

Pam Wideman, Director of Housing and Neighborhood Services said I would like to take a few moments to do a couple of things tonight. I want to provide you with an update on our Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Document. This is a document that we are required to do by HUD every five-years, and I also want to give you some information on our Housing Programs, which go hand in hand with the analysis of impediment and then also I want to remind you that you will be holding a public hearing downstairs tonight on this document and that we will request a vote from you at your December 9th Business Meeting, so we can send this on to HUD.

As previously mentioned, this is one of four documents that we are required to do; we are required to do this document every five-years, because we, the City of Charlotte, are known as a participating jurisdiction or a PJ in HUD speak and that simply means that because we get to the tune of about $10 million over four programs each year, we have to certify that we are affirmatively furthering fair housing. Those four programs in which we do our housing work are the Community Development Block Grant, the Home Program, the HOPWA Housing for persons with AIDS and HIV, and our emergency solution grant, and I will talk about each of those in just a little bit.

In terms of the Analysis of Impediment to Fair Housing, HUD establishes protected classes of people in housing based on these kinds of categories: race, color, religion, sex, disability, familial status and national origin, so we have to certify that we are affirmatively furthering fair housing when it relates to these classes because we get the allocation of federal funds that I just explained. The way that we do this is we work with the consultant to do this work for us. The last time you saw this work was in 2015 and we brought you a regional approach. We worked with the Centralina Council of Governments; this time we contracted with a consultant and that consultant conducted community outreach or...
November 25, 2019  
Business Meeting  
Minutes Book 148, Page 1100

community engagement sessions. We engaged our traditional fair-housing stakeholders; we conducted research and data analysis and then looked at state laws and other conditions that impact fair housing. In terms of the community engagement, we did a survey in both English and Spanish; we did several community engagement meetings. We had an online survey; we engaged in our social media platform such as Facebook and Instagram, and then tonight again, you will be holding a public hearing once you get downstairs.

Councilmember Harlow arrived at 5:12 p.m.

Ms. Wideman said the findings of the report, none of this was surprising to us and you all, to your credit, we are doing many ongoing things to continue dealing with these issues that not only play out in Charlotte but play out across the country. Things like disparities and access to opportunity and segregation, some of the many things that I will highlight that you guys are doing or we as a City are doing to improve these findings. The Comprehensive Plan, we are looking at it through an equity lens. You all approved your Housing Locational Guidelines, your scoring tool, and that was important because through that tool you are directing your housing access to places of high opportunity. Again, I talked about the Comprehensive Plan and then the major things that we can't forget is we increased our allocation of Housing Trust Fund from $15 million to $50 million and then we have the private sector who exceeded the match by $53 million, so we are putting more resources towards furthering affordable housing.

Things like the number of units, this goes back to the work, the increased funding that you are going and really recognizing that while we need to do family housing that we also need to continue to do housing for seniors as well. Some of the other things we are doing in terms of increasing the understanding about fair housing, the Office of Immigration Economic Mobility, which is headed by Federico Rios, making sure that those disadvantaged populations understand and have materials that are printed in both English and Spanish and making sure that they understand about the laws and the opportunities for homeownership as well. Those are the findings and again, you will hold the public hearing tonight, and you will be asked to approve the report on the 9th.

Just to further talk about the work that you are doing to further fair housing and just affordable housing in general throughout the City is I want to remind you and just highlight some successes over this past Council. The housing framework you all approved that in August of 2018; you've also approved several policies that go along with that framework or support the framework. You did your Housing Locational Guidelines; you did your guidelines for evaluating and disposing of City property. You approved your naturally occurring affordable housing guidelines; you did your TOD and then we also just recently went through a Code update.

In terms of some of the programs that you all have formalized or implemented, the Targeted Rehab Program, I know Ms. Mayfield had a really big hand in that. We did our naturally occurring affordable housing, this speaks to the preservation, the need to not only build new, but to preserve housing as well and then the Single-Family Acquisition Program, you all approved money in your budget last year for that as well. If you want to look at how we fund these programs, again, I talked about the four funding sources that we get as a City from HUD because based on our size of the City. Those four programs and you can see the dollar amount associated with those programs, but I do want to also highlight another grant that we've been recently awarded and that you all will be accepting tonight. It is our Lead Hazard Control Grant; that is to the tune of about $3.5 million. This is the third time we have received that and partners like National Leagues of Cities; they recognize us as a leader in the field, and in fact they are going to be hosting a session here in December, bringing some other cities in to look at the work that we are doing in that as well.

This is just a quick overview of how many people and households you've served through the various programs. You can see what you have done in terms of Emergency Solutions and that is really how you serve our homeless populations, rent and relocation assistance, the housing rehabilitation, preservation and new construction. Our Down Payment
Assistance Program is not just about multifamily rental, but we also understand the homeownership is a key to building wealth. One of the newest homeownership programs we’ve got is our Federal Home Loan Bank of Atlanta. We are going to be able to serve folks that just a little bit above that 80%, that is called Our Community Heroes Program. Mayor Lyles came and kicked off that event and that program with us, but we are going to be able to serve our community heroes like our Police, our Fire Fighters and our school teachers so that is really important. Then, we don’t just want to put people in homes, but as we are putting in people in homes, the Housing Counseling is very necessary, so we do that as well so really great results there.

Our Housing Trust Fund, I think you all had asked how are we doing on that. What I will say is that we have over 1,000 units under construction as a result of that $50 million, so applauds to you all for doing that. We talked about the use of publicly owned land for a long time. We had three parcels of City-owned land that will be under construction here very shortly and then we’ve leveraged that with the Charlotte Housing Opportunity Fund, and so you can see that about half of the units that are under construction received Housing Opportunity Fund. That is great; we have a partner in town, LISC, who is mediating that. The Foundation for the Carolinas raised that money, and that allowed your Trust Fund dollars to go further.

The balance we have in our Housing Trust Fund is about $21 million and so that will enable us to do the rounds that we need to do in January, both nine percent and four percent, and also, we still are able to do some NOAH preservation. As a reminder, you put about $6.3 million in your budget, in addition to the Housing Trust Fund last year to preserve some multi-family complexes and to do some single-family acquisition and rehab. I also want to remind you; I don’t think we’ve had an opportunity to remind you, since I was up before you; you had your nine percent’s that were awarded in August. So, again we received 300 units from that and that was about 182 units.

Again, as has been mentioned, public/private partnerships are key, and so LISC and the Foundation are our partners, and we’ve also had some other small contributions of land which is very helpful as well. In terms of how the State is our partner, again, you are very familiar with the nine percent and the four percent tax credits. What I will point out to you is we have about 300 units that didn’t receive any Trust Fund or any CHO funding that are under construction, so we should also point that out as well.

As I mentioned previous, your next steps tonight, you will hold a public hearing and then on December 9th you will be asked to approve the Impediments to Fair Housing. So, I wanted to tie the findings of the Impediments to Fair Housing and the outcomes together because that speaks to how we in this City continue to affirmatively further fair housing. I’ll stop and ask if you all have any questions.

**Mayor Lyles** said thank you for the update; I think sometimes we forget how much work is going on and to see what is underway as well as the impetus for why we continue to do this work. I read basically, the summary of the review of the organization that you hired to do the report, and I have to say there wasn’t a lot of new information in that report when they talked about the [inaudible] of segregation and poverty and how redlining works; it is basically an understanding of why we had to do more and continue to have to do more. I want to say thanks for the update and the consideration, knowing that we have to do Fair Housing Report Analysis in order to continue our federal funding.

**Councilmember Mayfield** said Ms. Wideman; thank you for all the work that you have done and for hearing our questions and concerns. This past week and weekend I had the opportunity with a couple of my colleagues, to attend our National League of Cities Conference, and I sat on the Race, Equity, and Leadership Council. We had a panel discussion, and I’m not sure if you are familiar with Andre Perry of the Booking Institute, but one of the things that was shared directly ties into our relationship with the banks being committed to reduce interest rate loans and the things that they are attempting to do. There is a direct correlation that has been identified and the Booking Institute has easily accessible information that looks at the relationship between appraisers and the mortgage company because what we are still seeing is that in majority minority
community even as new development and/or gentrification is happening that current homeowner who may be a minority, who may be African American specifically is still seeing a much lower appraisal rate than what their counterpart may be seeing. The challenge is also in the fact that more than 90% of the appraisers are non-African American. So, there is conversation that part of it is federal legislation, but part of it can be started on the local level and that is our relationships with the bank and how they identify appraisers, because representation does matter and when we don’t have at least the ability because in the loan process the original loan process or even in a refi process you have the ability to pick your closing attorney but not your appraisal company. There is a way when we talk about upward mobility and accessibility and also wealth building, if our partners in banking really want to be partners with helping us to address this need I would encourage some conversations regarding that impact, and this is where Council has control, because it they are using our dollars, if it is using dollars that are coming through the Trust Fund and other ways we should be able to lead that conversation to help change and bring that equity lens in this conversation, because I don’t think we’ve ever asked for an overlay since the new appraisal has been done that what are those homes that we helped to purchase in areas pre-gentrification and now in the middle and post gentrification to see what, if any, equity has grown in those homes. That is something I think we have an opportunity. I know recently a conversation triggered to even ask that question and then for the panel and the fact to learn that the Booking Institute has been doing quite a bit of research on it; here is an opportunity for us to look at things differently.

Mayor Lyles said I think that is a really good point, and we ought to look at this as a pathway, because like so many things, careers, there are requirements that are placed in the requirement to be certified or licensed that may not have much to do except being certified and not with your skill and levels. I think it is one of those things that we ought to look at, how do people get the opportunity to even be an appraiser and are there impediments in their way or how do we actually create a pipeline or pathway for people that are minority to participate in this, because there are four steps to do it and a lot details are required?

Councilmember Mitchell arrived at 5:25 p.m.

Councilmember Harlow said thanks Ms. Wideman; I know I walked in in the middle of it, but I got it up here on the iPad. I know we adopted the framework over a year ago now; the framework called for percentages for new construction, NOAH, preservation and anti-displacement, like a 40/40/20 type split to give us some guidance around how these housing dollars are spent. Are we in line with that or where are we in comparison to what the framework called for?

Ms. Wideman said I will remind you; I think the specific language around the framework was that is how it could be spent. We had a lot of conversations about, for example, multi-family NOAH’s, preservations. We don’t know when those opportunities are going to come, so we kind of have to go down this parallel track and get as much as we can while it is available. I would say we have over 1,000 units under new construction and then preservation. I think if I remember correctly we have four developments that we are working on preserving, so I would say maybe it is not a 50/50 split; perhaps it is about a 60/40, I haven’t done that math, and I know Mr. Driggs will keep me honest on that. So, I don’t want to shout out any numbers, but based on my professional opinion, I think we are exactly where we need to have down this parallel track and get as much as we can while it is available. I would say we have over 1,000 units under new construction and then preservation. I think if I remember correctly we have four developments that we are working on preserving, so I would say maybe it is not a 50/50 split; perhaps it is about a 60/40, I haven’t done that math, and I know Mr. Driggs will keep me honest on that. So, I don’t want to shout out any numbers, but based on my professional opinion, I think we are exactly where we need to be in terms of NOAH and preservation, and I think we have many opportunities that will come before us that will allow us to do more. That is just with the Housing Trust Fund, but if you think about your programs that you do outside of the Housing Trust Fund in terms of single-family rehab, the team is working as feverishly as they can. We are taking advantage of many opportunities to rehab and that also helps people stay in place. That is another opportunity for people to age and stay in place. I know that is a long answer, but I think we are right where we should be. Mr. Harlow said I appreciate that; I know it wasn’t always solid percentages, but I just want as future Councils move forward, we should always be looking at all of housing programs, not just the Trust Fund, because that bond ask might change over time, but some of these programs we always want to continue participating in. I was kind of curious as to how we fit into what we sought after when we adopted the framework.
Ms. Wideman said the other thing I would add around the preservation, we are continuing to talk with new partners everyday about them coming on board to help us rehab, because we know we need more public/private partners.

Marcus Jones, City Manager said I would add to that; what you did in this last budget to some extent was to address that, because the vast majority of the Housing Trust Fund dollars are for the new construction, but by having the single-family rehab and the NOAH’s, I think what is maybe $6 million of additional funds on an off-bond cycle. It was trying to address being a bit more nimble.

Councilmember Phipps said I know when we did the immigration implementation exercise and plan I thought as part of that we had included several additional languages that would be a part of that. I noticed this particular fair housing survey we only looked at English and Spanish, is that it?

Ms. Wideman said yes sir.

Mr. Phipps said will the next one include any additional languages or was that just for any publications that the City might produce that would be in those different languages? Is it exclusively for that or would it be something that we would employ on surveys like this?

Ms. Wideman said Mr. Phipps, you are right; for this document we just looked at English and Spanish, but what I would say is that is one of the beauties of having Federico’s new office is that we have the opportunity to expand and as we do our next five-year plan.

Mayor Lyles said the public hearing is on the agenda tonight and there will be a vote on December 9th to adopt the report findings.

ITEM NO. 4: OFFICE OF EQUITY, MOBILITY, AND IMMIGRANT INTEGRATION UPDATE

Federico Rios, Assistant Director of Equity, Mobility and Immigrant Integration said specifically offering an update around the work that has been done in regards to the office and looking at the diversity, equity, and inclusions recommendations that you all received last year in December and discussing future initiatives, programming and events. I think it is important to start by looking at what all the office incapsulates, and when you look at this particular slide you are looking at three different reports, and this speaks to the evolution of the work that this office is focused on.

Again, in 2015 the Immigrant Integration Taskforce Report, which Councilmember Phipps just mentioned, was presented to Council. In 2017 from a community perspective, the equity mobility work was taken on by the Leading on Opportunity Report and then in 2018 the report that I just referenced came out. Again, this is a work that has evolved over time. It is important to acknowledge that most governments that have this work do so in silos, but we’ve done it differently. It is a recognition of the deep connection and interdependence of these focus areas.

To offer a recap from the presentation that we offered last year, these are the definitions that we as a group determined were important to lead our work. Again, you will see that equity is there in the center, and it is important that it be in the center, because really it is the hinge with which all this work moves. Equity has to be applied to everything. Often in the history of this City, what we have done is focus on equality, the same for everyone. Equity is really tailoring what we do for the individual needs of our residents. Equity is the why of the work; it drives us both internally and externally.

So, to give you a sense of what equity looks like, I have offered you a cartoon here and you will notice that the gentlemen are attempting to clear the steps in an effort to get the most people up to the area they want to get to; whereas, if he focused on the wheelchair
ramp he would get everyone up. So, when we think about this, the work that we do is about being proactive about identifying and helping to eliminate barriers that historically prevented groups from accessing opportunities. In this way, we build the community and organization that works for everyone. Equity in practice is important; so, if we think about providing curb cuts in sidewalks, that doesn’t just benefit the person that is in the wheelchair; it benefits the person that is walking as well. If we think about it in regard to policy, what we in this building do if there was a fire, and we couldn’t see? It is really us ensuring that everyone has access to safety and security. We are ensuring that our policies and practices are accessible for all.

We started this process last year. So, again, thanks to those that were members of the Immigrant Community Committee; policy recommendations were put forward that this entire Council approved. This provided us some momentum in relation to the grander scheme of the work. Again, this is proof that the work can be done with both a policy and community approach.

At this point, I will give you an update around the community recommendations; you saw the policy recommendations that you all approved in regard to the community recommendations that staff has seen forward we graduated our first Spanish language Civic Leadership Academy cohort. We will continue to solicit corporate, faith and non-profit signatories to the compact that you all signed unanimously. We’ve also done a survey in tandem with HR who have been amazing partners in relation to the large scope of this work. Where we were able to identify that we had 100 plus bilingual employees and more than 30 languages spoken amongst those individuals. We are continuing to convene our naturalization providers. Again, this is work that without our doing just does not get done. I will just key in on one point here; by identifying our bilingual employees, we are offering our organization an opportunity to better connect with those groups that are often left out as Mr. Phipps just mentioned.

When we think of the scope of the work, internally we serve as the City’s equity advisors. We work alongside our different departments, and we are doing this because we are tasked with addressing an endemic systemic issue. Our scope of work is vast; it is the size and depth of the work that requires significant amount of time and intentionality. So, we are really doing that deep dive internally to ensure our policies and practices are adequate to support our organization and then externally we are able to move forward and catalyze efforts to advance economic mobility and immigrant integration, recognizing again, that they are interconnected. We are doing this in a number of ways.

We still have a lot of work to do, and the next slide will be the recommendations that were given to you last December and then update on where we are on these recommendations. I will not belabor you with each individual thing; I’ll just over a couple of the highlights. Again, at the beginning of this fiscal year Council approved the expansion of the Office of what was International Relations into the Office of Equity, Mobility, and Immigrant Integration. You will also notice in the slide that we’ve worked closely with Planning and Transportation and many other departments that are represented here today on ensuring that equity is the bedrock of our 2040 Comprehensive Plan and addressing our community’s transportation needs and other issues.

This is our Phase 1 of the Plan; this is really where we first start out, and in Phase 2 we continue to do work as well. We’ve been embedded in Charlotte Water Strategic Planning process and working in tandem with our Community Relations Department to craft inequity training for Aviation staff. We’ve also helped advise Community Relations on their ADA planning. We are proud to report that that plan is at a 50% completion at this point.

In Phase 3, I will highlight one particular item here, which I think is incredibly important and really, really exciting. You will see that we’ve partnered with Common Wealth Charlotte again, in tandem with our HR Department to offer the full suite of services that that organization provides. These are economic services, and you will notice specifically the low interest loans that are provided to individuals. These opportunity loans offer second chance access to credit for clients and in our case our employees with credit
scores under 500. Interest is prepaid at a significant low rate and made available through our 100% donor provided fund. This help a client refinance loans, predatory in some nature, provide rental deposit for housing and manage other financial emergencies while improving his or her credit score through repayment. There is a great opportunity of connecting our organization’s individuals that work on the lower end of the spectrum that get paid less with opportunities to be provided for their financial needs.

Shifting to the external work, we have launched our Opportunity Labs model. Now, it is important to recognize that this model comes from a place where it has been done in other areas: Washington, DC; New York; and Boston. All three of those cities have really focused only internally. They have looked at what they can do for their employees. You noticed in what we mentioned with Common Wealth Charlotte; that is an internal focus measure. We’ve decided that we want to do this both internally and externally, and we want to do this in a way that we are really addressing a root issue. So, you will notice here the statement inequity stagnates mobility, which leads to crime. Often times, what we do in our community is focus on symptom management. We don't look at what the cause of the issue is. So, our approach is to really dig in deep with the root issue. Again, this is us working alongside leaders in our community and recognizing that they have the solutions. It is a matter of us providing the support they need.

I want to take a moment just to share that this model really was birthed in part out of conversations with Councilmember Mayfield. A couple months back, she called me on a weekend and we had a lengthy discussion around all the different things that are happening in our community and we ended up on this point where we discussed African-American, trans women being victims of violence. In that discussion, we realized that there wasn’t non-profit organizations that have been stood up that specifically focused on that community and that led to discussions with the team around how do we better construct a model to address those gaps? We recognize that these things are happening in perpetuity often times, but we are not making a concentrated effort to address them. So, we launched an Opportunity Labs effort really to plug dollars into where we see the gaps are.

I offer you two examples on our Opportunity Lab Strategies; again, kudos to HR for working in tandem with us on this and other departments I’ll specifically mention, Fire in internal example. So, we recognize that the problem here is that we lack diversity. There are many areas in our departments where we just don’t have enough different people working together and what we thought through again, in tandem with HR, is how do we develop a training program with a mentorship overlay that targets our lower-wage earning labor force for higher-wage careers? To say that another way, we recognize Fire could benefit from more diversity and we recognize that we have a lot of diversity when it comes to our lower-wage staff. Can we afford a pathway to increase upward mobility through a comprehensive training and build social capital through this mentoring piece that can be developed through the peer relationships and in so doing do we benefit both groups? Recognizing that we have laborers in Solid Waste Services that get capped out after five-years and can’t go much further when it comes to salary, what if we opened the door where Fire is a viable career, and we eliminate the barriers that would keep them from being able to access that career opportunity?

In the external example, you will see that we are talking about working with community leaders. We recognize that there is a good deal of individuals in our community that are doing great work, but we recognize that they need yet still more support, so a Greg Jackson with Heal Charlotte, Jamal Kinard with the Lake View Organization.

Can we work alongside them to train them with evidence-based programmatic models? Can we teach them how to run the data that they need to not only seek our City funding but also be able to access other funding sources that have not been available to them in the past, and in so doing can we then change what is happening in our community? Can we focus an initiative like this specifically on our crime hot spots? When we look at Heal Charlotte that is an initiative that is occurring along I-85 and Reagan Drive adjacent to Sugar Creek Road; it is one of highest, violent-crime areas in our community. By doing this, we address the root issue that undergirds all of our work.
Lastly, I will offer again, on a high note, an update in relation to the work that we’ve done around Immigrant Integration. This year June 3rd through 5th, we will be hosting the Welcoming Interactive which is Welcoming America’s National Conference. This interactive focus is to talk about inclusivity, and how do we do a better job still? How do we glean from our partners and other municipalities around the country and non-profit organizations to be a more inclusive organization? How do we endure that we benefit by creating a strong economy by working in this way? We are also hoping that, through this process, we will become a certified welcoming City as a certified welcoming City we must undergo a process where we go through a review of how we do business in the City? How do we ensure that everyone has access to opportunity and is able to get what they need from a language perspective? I’m excited to share this with you all and look forward to seeing you at that event.

Councilmember Mayfield said Manage Jones, I want to thank you. We went back and forth regarding the creation of this position and what it could look like and what should happen. I want to publicly acknowledge that we made you, as the Manager made the right selection and Mr. Rios with his extensive work. As he mentioned we have had numerous conversations and he a wealth of knowledge and experience in multiple levels on that same note Federico, I want to tell you thank you for hearing, because there are a lot of concerns that still are happening on the ground, especially when we look at the LGBTQI community and specifically trans women of color and what is happening. I also want to reiterate the statement and suggestion I made earlier, because this still ties in; if we are going to be looking at working with some of our staff with housing and looking at getting their credit scores up, even in that home you have to have an appraisal done. Right out the back from the beginning the cost of an appraisal is $400 to $500; there is no negotiating. That company, whoever is identified sets their rate, if that company is not using an equity lens- The Mayor hit on the piece that I neglected to mention, and that is that some cities have created an actual set aside grant to help with the training, but it is not just training individuals as appraisers; it is training that company, because it is not individuals that the banking institution works with unless we are talking about the community bank creating something very different than what has been seen across the nation. It is making sure that we have a commitment just like we do with Mayor’s Youth Employment Program with those partners that okay, if we commit to working to get X number of appraisers graduated and certified. Your commitment is to hire X number and to actually employ utilize. So, we still have another opportunity, because if we are going to talk about equity and access there are some things through our role in government where we can change some conversations and these are things that a lot of people just never thought about that are barriers, and that is a major barrier if you are doing everything right and your checking off the boxes and you are working hard but then when the time comes if the value of that home is undervalued you are still in that same hole.

Councilmember Egleston said the beginning of Ms. Mayfield’s comments pretty much captured everything I wanted to say, but I’m glad we are doing this work now, and Mr. Rios I’m glad you are leading this work now. I think you are the right person for it, and you’ve got a small but mighty team, and I’m just glad to see all the progress. So, thank you, and thank the Manager for allowing this to take place.

Councilmember Ajmera said good work as our colleagues have said. I have a question around commitment to leading an opportunity recommendation; you have in one of your slides there is monetary commitment. What does that look like?

Mr. Rios said we are looking at working with Leading on Opportunity to actually get dollars to the community leaders that we had discussed earlier. Again, we recognize from the beginning of the slide deck you saw the integral role that the Leading on Opportunity Report plays. So, how do we work in tandem with Leading on Opportunity recognizing their work with community leaders and ensuring that those community leaders are supported?

Ms. Ajmera said would this a grant from the City to this organization or individually?
Mr. Rios said potentially, we have worked details out; we are still very much in flux in regards to how we are going to structure, but we will be using the $500,000 set aside that we got through the jump start grant.

Ms. Ajmera said so that has already been allocated?

Mr. Rios said correct.

Ms. Ajmera said so this is not additional funding.

Mr. Rios said this is not additional funding no, ma’am.

Marcus Jones, City Manager said I would like to add, one thing that we did in this year’s budget is try to align all of the funding that we have in our $2.6 billion budget that is related to recommendations from the Leading on Opportunity Report. So, we captured that and it is everything from the all-access path for our employees. I think there were 14 different areas that we aligned different programs that do align with the report.

Ms. Ajmera said on a separate note, Federico we had talked about the requests that we get in terms of opportunities for classes specifically around US citizenship, and I know you and I had talked about it, but I didn’t see that being incorporated here.

Mr. Rios said if you look back, the convening of the naturalization providers is our way of addressing this. We are working in tandem with those providers to build out capacity and to ensure that they are working in tandem. This workaround providing citizenship classes is sorely underfunded and incredibly difficult, and there have been changes in the federal government to make it even more difficult with the pay structure increase that is potentially going forward. So, in working in tandem with them and building out capacity amongst them, helping them to see the whole thing we are able to address that need.

Ms. Ajmera said I agree with you; I’ve gone through this process of naturalization and specially around the application fee where it creates a lot of barriers for those who can’t necessarily apply. I have seen cities and states across the nation that actually provide free training for those classes because this requires pretty extensive studying to pass the test. In terms of monitoring benefits, I guess I’m trying to understand would any of this monitoring amount that we are setting aside from jump start- Are we working with naturalization provider?

Mr. Rios said we have not put those two things together, but that is not to say that we couldn’t look at it. I think at this point we’ve spent a lot of time building our capacity amongst this group, working really closely with these groups of organizations. It has not been a formalized request from any of them. Emily Yaffe is here who leads that initiative. If anything, they are really grateful to have the opportunity to cooperate and collaborate amongst each other, because otherwise the federal government just requires that they meet to hear numbers. There is no incentive to collaborate. So, our effort in getting them all in the same room and kind of hearing the same data and setting goals in unison is the extent of the work thus far. That is not to say that we couldn’t look at how better to support them as well.

Ms. Ajmera said I think that is a great start where we are having a centralized place where everyone can gather, and I think that was a big gap. Many times, I have received requests from our residents that are looking to get some of those classes. It certainly gives me an opportunity to connect them with this group. I think this is a great start, but I think if we can continue to keep an eye on this where there are critical barriers to US citizenship, and I think if we can address those that also addresses some of the longer-term issues that we are seeing that come in from of us in the Chamber.

Mr. Rios said I will say two items tied to this; one is that we are looking at rolling out a marketing campaign. Again, Emily Yaffe leads this work that she saw in Germany when she went on an exchange so, this is a marketing campaign where we would work in tandem with the library, we have deep partnership there, to be able to ensure that
individuals know the process. We’ve also worked in tandem with a group of interns, I call them interns, but they are really amazing, incredibly smart high school students that put together a website where we collect all of the data in one central location. So, prior to that all of the data was [inaudible]. You couldn’t access what were all the citizenship classes that were available? How do I get to them? What do I need to bring? All of that is collected in one space now through that partnership.

**Mayor Lyles** said again, the work that we are seeing and hearing about tonight moves our City forward in ways that implements the thinking that we had for equity and inclusion and being welcoming, and we are backing it with actual results and funding so thank you very much.

* * * * * *

**ITEM NO. 5: 2020 COUNCIL MEETING CALENDAR**

**Stephanie Kelly, City Clerk** said thank you so much for allowing me this opportunity. I would just like to briefly review the proposed 2020 calendar. In accordance with the North Carolina General Statues, the City Clerk is required to maintain on file a schedule of the City Council’s regular meetings. So, considering the holidays and other meetings of state and national organizations in which the City has memberships. The Clerk’s Office drafts a calendar for review and consideration. The calendar shows at the top a legend that shows Strategy Sessions on the first Monday, Business Meetings and Public Forums on the second and fourth Mondays, and the Zoning Meeting for the third Mondays. Highlights of the calendar for 2020 include the Annual Strategy Retreat, which is scheduled for January 12th – 15th, which is earlier than most years. Also, the Budget Workshop, the first of which is scheduled for February 5th.

So, once the calendar is adopted by City Council, it is filed and maintained in the City Clerk’s Office and is also posted on our website, and no further notice of regular meetings are required once this calendar is approved. I would add that if there are any amendments to the regular meeting calendar, such as if you cancel a meeting, we have to update this calendar and then post it again on the website. So, this is the proposed calendar, and in your attachments to the agenda there was a correction in the legend up at the top for the second Mondays, it now has the exception of January and March and the exceptions are noted. This will come back to you on December 9th on the Business Agenda for adoption.

**Mayor Lyles** said I just note Tuesday, November 3rd is the Presidential election, and I know that we are scheduled for November 2nd meeting. I just wanted to bring that up just in case there are very active people in this group. That would be the County Commission and the Legislators, the Senators, the State, everybody except us. So, I just wondered if that was something that we should look at as a Strategy Session. That is something we may want to think about. I think Mr. Phipps had another comment.

**Councilmember Phipps** said I was wondering with respect to the CRTPO Representative would that be something that should be added to this calendar? I know it is just for particular Councilmember, but it is very critical that the lead delegate for CRTPO show up at all the CRTPO meetings or else you wouldn’t have a corium. So, I don’t know if this should be a part of it or how that works.

Mayor Lyles said I think that we can probably do a separate calendar; this is just for when all 12 of us are to be included, just like you. We would have CRTPO; we have MTC that if you don’t go things don’t happen. There are a number of meetings like that, so I think the most important things is that if we can’t attend the meetings, especially those where it impacts the agenda and the ability for the group to do the work we need to take personal accountability to find a substitute for that position. On CRTPO, we will have a direct representative and an alternate, and there are few others that may require that same thing. We hope to get those appointments out by December 2nd.

**Marcus Jones, City Manager** said I was just verifying with Liz Babson that the first meeting of CRTPO is January 15th.
Mayor Lyles said we will have our representative by them. We are going to have our first Budget Workshop February 5th; that is early.

Mr. Jones said what we tried to do is replicate to some extent what occurred last year and right after the Retreat the first Wednesday of February, March, and April were designed to be Budget Workshops.

Mayor Lyles said that is with the full Council, so the Budget Committee will be meeting right after the Retreat. You can stay an extra night and get the work done there or maybe just keep working all the time. We will go to dinner, and you guys have a Committee meeting, and we will be sure to have the appropriate level of cuisine there for you. We will have to figure that out, how to get the Budget and Effectiveness Governance Committee maybe right after the February 5th. Would it be better to do it after?

Mr. Jones said that will be fine.

Mayor Liles said we will talk about that.

ITEM NO. 6: ANSWERS TO MAYOR AND COUNCIL CONSENT ITEM QUESTIONS

Mayor Lyles said Item No. 52 has been settled by staff, so we won’t include that in the Consent Agenda; Item No. 11 is deferred to December 9th and Item Nos. 65 and 67 are deferred to January.

Stephanie Kelly, City Clerk said I have an additional item that has been added to the deferral list, Item No. 64.

Councilmember Mayfield said did we already pull out for separate vote Item Nos. 34 and 35?

Mayor Lyles said no, but I can note that. Those are Airport Website and Mobile Application Service and Long-Term Investment Program Investment Consulting Services.

Councilmember Phipps said this doesn’t relate to the Consent Items, but I was wondering if staff could really look into the proliferation of these Obamacare signs that sprung up all over the City. I don’t know if any other districts have them, but I know District 4 has been plastered almost at every intersection, and I don’t know if we can investigate who is actually this to be able to initiate some kind of enforcement action, but they are all in the medians. It doesn’t adhere to the Sign Ordinance guidelines, and they are just like everywhere.

Mayor Lyles said I think Ms. Wideman is aware of that and she has got things going. I think in District 3 and 4. Anyone else have them? There are still a few political signs out guys; some people from here still have a few signs out.

We can take a few actions up here if we move some things around on the agenda. Could we do the Consent Agenda since no-one has signed up to speak on any of the Consent Agenda items, and we have a few that are going to require a separate vote. Could we go ahead and adopt the Consent Agenda now Mr. Baker?

Patrick Baker, City Attorney said so long as you are doing it again in open session.

Mayor Lyles said no, I don’t want to do it again; that was not the intent.

ITEM NO. 7: CLOSES SESSION

There was no closed session.
The Action Review meeting recessed at 6:05 p.m. to move to the Council Chamber for the regularly scheduled Business Meeting.

* * * * * * *

BUSINESS MEETING

The City Council of the City of Charlotte, North Carolina reconvened for a Business Meeting on Monday, November 25, 2019 at 6:30 p.m. in the Meeting Chamber of the Charlotte Mecklenburg Government Center with Mayor Vi Lyles presiding. Councilmembers present were Dimple Ajmera, Tariq Bokhari, Ed Driggs, Larken Egleston, Julie Eiselt, Justin Harlow, LaWana Mayfield, James Mitchell, Matt Newton, Greg Phipps and Braxton Winston, II.

Mayor Lyles said thank you for coming to our pre-Thanksgiving Meeting. I hope that every one of you will have a really good week. Thanksgiving is one of those few times that we can celebrate and understand quickly why we are doing and being grateful for our family and friends and our country at the same time.

* * * * * * *

INVOCATION AND PLEDGE

Councilmember Newton gave the Invocation. Pledge of Allegiance to the flag was led by the Flaming Socks Patrol; they will become Boy Scouts in February. Their leaders are Mr. Galmon and Mr. Meeks.

Mr. Newton said I would like to start tonight with two things; first, I would like to recognize Councilmembers Harlow, Mayfield, and Phipps. This technically is not their last City Council meeting, because we have one more meeting for our outgoing members be sworn out and new members sworn in. Having said that, I think we are unofficially recognizing tonight as their final Councilmember meeting and just wanted to thank them for their dedication and extend my gratitude for their service to our City.

I also wanted to wish everyone a Happy and safe Thanksgiving; that also includes our furry friends. This Holiday Season with plummeting temperatures and every present possibility of inclement weather please remember to bring your pets indoors. With that I ask that we all pray silently together, each of us according to our individual beliefs. Let us offer thanks for our daily bread and blessings for one another. Let us seek to be a source of hope for those in need and guide us in truth, fairness, goodwill, friendship and concern for others. Let us, this Council, give gratitude for our opportunity to serve our great city and give us the strength to make the right decisions. Let the feelings of love, kindness and a well-directed, yet gentle, spirit always be reflected in all that we do in this we pray.

* * * * * * *

AWARDS AND RECOGNITION

ITEM NO. 10: HOMELESS AWARENESS MONTH PROCLAMATION

Councilmember Harlow read the following proclamation.

WHEREAS, the month of November welcomes in both a time of thanksgiving and a season for sharing our resources and our freedoms to worship, work, and live as independently as possible; and

WHEREAS, some members of our community do not have adequate employment or a place to live for a variety of reasons, both simple and complex; and
WHEREAS, there are efforts to bring these homeless children and adults out of the shadows of our abundance, to address the diverse needs among them as well as to provide guidance on how to correct conditions that have led to their poverty and homelessness; and

WHEREAS, our current economic challenges call for greater awareness and guidance to address needs among all of our neighbors; and

WHEREAS, The Charlotte-Mecklenburg Homeless Services Network, its member organizations, and its public partners in the City of Charlotte and Mecklenburg County desire to dispel myths and overcome stereotypes of homelessness and to provide opportunities for all of our citizens to learn about the plight, the hopes, and the achievements of homeless neighbors of our community and to welcome them:

NOW, THEREFORE, WE, Vi Alexander Lyles, Mayor of Charlotte, and George Dunlap, Chair of the Mecklenburg County Board of Commissioners do hereby proclaim the month of November, 2019, as

“HOMELESS AWARENESS MONTH”

In Charlotte and Mecklenburg County and urge all of our citizens to honor this observance.

The proclamation was accepted by Mrs. Angie Forde.

Mayor Lyles said Mrs. Forde has been doing this; I think the first time I met her was at a meeting out in Ballantyne at a high school where we were beginning to talk about housing and homelessness and she has been. I’m not going to say how many years ago, because I don’t know that I would be accurate and certainly don’t want to impede upon how long we’ve been working together on this issue. I want to say thank you, because she has always stood and always spoken out in a lot of our work and the result of our work in the result of you advocacy.

* * * * * * *

Mayor Lyles said tonight I would like to take a moment to acknowledge a member of our City Council who recently became the recipient of an extremely prestigious award. It took place this weekend at the National League of Cities Annual City Summit Conference in San Antonio. The National Black Caucus of locally elected officials conveyed the highest honor available to our very own LaWana Mayfield. She was presented with the Mary F. Gordon Distinguished Service Award, which is named after the former foundation director of the NLC, who worked for the NLC for 23-years on issues of social justice and equity. Her namesake award is only given to those who show outstanding leadership in finding solutions towards improving and empowering the black community, most notably in the area of promoting minority-owned business opportunities. Anyone who has worked with Councilmember Mayfield knows that she embodies all of these attributes and is always a champion of equity for all. Please join me in a round of applause for this year’s Mary F. Gordon Distinguished Service Award winner Councilmember LaWana Mayfield.

* * * * * * *

PUBLIC FORUM

Charlotte’s Carbon Footprint – Electric Buses

Eduard Andrade, 110 North Alexander Street, Mount Holly said it my honor to be speaking to you about the proposal to integrate electric buses in the 2030 Transit Plan and to promote the use of the Volkswagen Settlement Funds to start Charlotte’s first pilot program. While I admire the current 2030 Plan and its ambition to want to focus on the rail line for Mecklenburg region, it is neglecting the City’s buses for everyday commuters. With thousands of folks taking the City buses every day, it should make sense to continue
November 25, 2019
Business Meeting
Minutes Book 148, Page 1112

investing in a bus system that has helped the community immensely over the decades. The only part that is included in this current plan for the City’s buses is a single rapid transit line on I-77. Though this plan still sets aside maintaining a fleet of over 500 buses, that could be much more cost-effective if we started investing in better bus technology, not to mention that with the North Carolina funds from the Volkswagen settlement the state is ready to appropriate thousands of dollars to municipalities who only need apply for it.

A battery-electric bus on today’s electricity is the cheapest and lowest carbon option in the county. Just listen to the fuel economy. A diesel bus average 3.6 miles per gallon at $.91 per mile. A hybrid bus is a little better at five miles per gallon at $.63 per mile but none compare with the electric bus that can average 20 to 25 miles per electric gallon at $.21 per mile to the taxpayer. You want to see how these numbers can quickly add up and how the funds saved from this shift can be focused on a variety of other projects like infrastructure or affordable housing, not to mention the continuous spending on outdated buses that are mandated to be used for 12-years once they are bought. This transition could be a fundamental pivot point for the City of Charlotte, and its transportation system, which is why I decided to speak with BYD and Poteria, two of the best competing bus companies in the world and who want to work with Charlotte closely about this. I truly hope that this Council can realize what electric bus transportation can mean to the people of Charlotte. Understand that I’m not here to propose new deal or to force residents to buy electric cars because an effective environmental policy should be able to balance the reality of people’s daily struggles while ensuring a prosperous future worth living.

Noise Ordinance

Linda Weigel, 315 Arlington Avenue said I live in The Arlington, as you know the pink building on South Boulevard. That being said there is a lack of ordinance enforcement by the Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department that has led me to be here tonight. South End is a mix of residential spaces, commercial spaces and even artistic spaces; there is no reason we all can’t live in a peaceful vicinity. Nearly every night between 10:00 o’clock and closing a large group of cars, trucks and motorcycles begin leaving the parking lot located behind Hot Taco in South End. The biggest problem seems to be Tuesday evenings that start around 9:00 and go to well after midnight. On Friday and Saturday nights being the next loudest; Tuesday night is probably the loudest. The parking lot sits directly in front of The Arlington. These individuals are leaving the restaurants and bars located in the Hot Taco building; they are screaming, yelling and lots of horn honking, and the horn honking goes on for hours while the drunk bar-goers leave the area in a disorderly manner. Most notably, there is a symphony of motorcycles revving their engines to compare notes with each other for about 45-minutes every night. It is not unusual to see cars and motorcycles parked on the sidewalk directly in front of Hot Taco completely blocking the sidewalk along the light rail and Bland Street. My neighbors and I have complained to anyone that will listen in these instances. I’ve called the City. I’ve called the Police many times and was eventually able to speak with Sgt. Joe Cary who promised he would handle the noise in this Division, but nothing appears to have been done, no changes have occurred. We’ve been encouraged to call 911, which we do-
Recently, I joined the network called Nextdoor; you might be familiar with it. They let you know what is going on in the community, and it is real helpful. It shares events. I’ve noticed a lot of posting on there about break-ins, so it is not just our little Royal Court, but it is all over the City. It is in Dilworth, Elmhurst, South End, Hunters Lane, 14 on Fillmore Street. I have talked with the Officers at the Police Department only to find out that the reason is, they are frustrated just as much as we are about the problem. It is usually the same people committing the crime, breaking into the car, shattering the windows, and the District Attorney’s Office doesn’t prosecute them because who knows why and probably, because they have a big caseload, but I was just hoping that maybe you could look into it with the District Attorney to find out what could be done about it.

**Making Parts and Greenways Safer**

**Billy Shue, 1509 West Sugar Creek Road** said it is an honor to be able to speak tonight, and what I would like to speak on is advocating for the safety of users of our Charlotte Greenways. I live pretty close to the Mallard Creek Greenway and there were two very terrible assault incidents that have happened over the past couple of months, and I wanted to come with some new possible solutions on things that can be done to improve this situation. I think having increased police patrols on the Greenway could definitely help, and I personally have seen that. There have been more police on bikes and in parking lots where there have been car break-ins. I would also like to advocate for neighborhood watches to either be implemented or to be increased and to encourage good men and women to join these neighborhood watches to coordinate with the police, join hand in hand with the police and being able to better ensure safety on the greenways.

The last thing I would like to propose is more technology solutions and that would be having more emergency call boxes on the greenways, particular ones where you don’t run into issues with flooding and having surveillance as well, and The Rath Security Company, they have a variety of different call boxes and surveillance cameras, and they have a category that is just for trail systems. That would be a really good site to be able to look at and I would be more than happy to e-mail the City Clerk with some of those options so you all can look at it in a future meeting. Those are the main things, just more police presence, look into increasing neighborhood watches with good men and women and trying to have more emergency call boxes and surveillance out there.

**Councilmember Bokhari** said someone drew my attention toward your post that you were coming to speak on this, so I had an opportunity to speak to CMPD today and just a couple things, so everyone knows. We have a heavy officer presence and continuous zone checks there; we’ve been doing paid off duty presence through Parks and Rec. Bicycles and duel sport motorcycles are showing a consistent presence, and we are in talks with groups like University City Partners to employ a UTV that is enabled to patrol harder to reach areas, and there has also been a heavier media blitz from CMPD Public Affairs to bring awareness to the issue.

Again, the tips for folks out there while we are getting our hands around this are run in groups or with a buddy, run or walk in well-lit areas, be aware of your surroundings, don’t be distracted particularly listening to loud music while you are out there and let someone know your route. Again, I saw your post on The Rath technology. I relayed that to them. This is one of those things where the partnership between the City and the County is very important because it is the County that would ultimately be responsible for either the blue light call boxes or the surveillance, but I believe that is something my Co-Chair of Intergovernmental Relations, and I could talk about with them.

**More Green Space in Charlotte**

**Bryce Aaron, 2711 Providence Road** said I am a student at Myers Park High School, as well as a local citizen who cares about the balance of urban development and green space. As in any City, especially one growing as rapidly as Charlotte, it is important to take into account certain factors that determine the quality of life for its citizens. There needs to be optimal and convenient living, transportation, recreation, economic and [inaudible]. One of the most challenging aspects of balancing these centers is the
integration of green space. Green space or natural space can be defined as an area with natural features and growth that lacks urban development. Charlotte is substantially behind in this area of green space when compared with other cities.

Only six percent of Charlotte’s land is used for Parks and Recreation compared to the national average of 15%. This is backed by the 2019 parks score rating ranking of Charlotte. Our City was ranked 96th out of 100 largest cities in the United States and nearly last in terms of accessibility to parks. Shockingly, only 36% of residents live within a 10-minute walk of a park according to parks score. Having access is crucial for healthy citizens according to work health organization article having access to a green space can reduce health and equality and prove all being in aid and treatment of mental illness. It also stated that physical activity in a natural environment can help remedy mild depression and reduce phycological stress indicators, more so, a survey by Mecklenburg Parks and Recreation found that 99% of response agreed that the benefits from parks, nature preserves, and greenways can improve the quality of life as well as improve physical health and fitness. The survey also found that 94% of citizens agree that having green space can attract new residents and businesses.

Green space might occupy prime real estate, it can offset the cost of being there with new residents and companies that potentially would move to Charlotte. The benefits are numerous, and the downsides are few, even if someone never goes to a local park it still has a positive influence on their health. Green space can provide vital ecosystem services that are necessary in an urban environment. Charlotte is an amazing City, but it can be even better. We should make green space more abundant and accessible to its citizens because of the benefit it provides to all people, the economy and the environment.

**Dog Tethering**

**Julie Adams, 654 Vendue Place** said I’m here to talk about the needed ordinance to ban untended tethered dogs. Currently, in Charlotte Mecklenburg, there are no laws prohibiting the amount of time a dog can be tethered outside on a chain. The current ordinance surrounding the protection are basic comfort or limited at best and do very little to ease their suffering. We are asking our local government to follow the lead of countless other communities in our state and around the country and change this law. According to the Humane Society of the United States, long-term restraint can severely damage the dogs physical and phycological wellbeing and otherwise friendly and dossal dog when kept continuously chained becomes neurotic, unhappy, anxious, and often aggressive. We all know of many instances where a child has entered a yard with a tethered dog and being bitten sometimes fatally. The physical damage to those continuously tethered dogs can be extensive; necks become raw and collars become embedded. These chains make them at risk for strangulation, entanglement and attacks by other animals and dogs. It is common for them to go without being fed regularly and their water bowls are often overturned. Veterinary care can be limited in the effect from extreme temperature is severe and thank you for your comments on that.

They have no way to escape the crippling Charlotte heat or to stay warm when out temperatures dip below freezing. We want to work together to make our community a safer, healthier and more humane place to live. We are all aware in this room the types of stories followed most closely on the local news. Any story which recounts inhumane treatment of an animal or abuse of a child is the one that gets the most attention. Those cities that continuously have these stores leading their newscast are the ones people decide they don’t want to live in. These are the places people don’t want to move to or move their businesses to. There is a very real economic picture that is painted in a community with substandard and outdate animal ordinances.

**Eric Bruce, 2300 South Boulevard** said I would like to thank you for giving me this opportunity to also express my support for a new anti-tethering ordinance. I am a concerned voter; I live in District 3 and I’m an advocate because such an ordinance aligns with my spiritual values and also because all of the science around animal welfare and community safety support such an ordinance. Let’s first talk about spiritual values; Charlotte is known as a City of churches. Billy Graham Library is touted as the number
one activity in Charlotte. Faith is very important here; I recognize we are not in a church; however, I feel it is important to note that the sacred text of every major world religion all speak to importance of being kind to animals.

Let's talk next about the science around animal welfare. Experts have long agreed that tethering is not conducive to the health and welfare of dogs. U.S. Department of Agriculture issue a statement, our experience in enforcing the Animal Welfare Act have led to conclude that the continuous confinement of dogs by tether is inhumane. Every major animal welfare group in the United States is united against unattended tethering. This science is settled. Let's talk next about the science of community safety. The American Veterinarian Association has quoted, saying neither tether nor chain your dog because this can contribute to aggressive behavior. I have other scientific studies but due to time constraints I’ll just say the community safety science is also settled. Finally, I will offer that 30-states have already implemented tethering laws; 15 North Carolina cities and counties have as well. Let Charlotte be next.

Circus Animals

Jill Woody, 4228 Commonwealth Avenue said I'm here speaking on behalf of the ban of animals in circuses that visit Charlotte. These magnificent creatures, such as: camels, elephants, zebras, bears, tigers have a strong family bond. They are separated from their families as babies and they are broken with the use of violent acts like beating and isolation. They spend most of their lives being transported in small cages, not even big enough to turn around. The circuses that come to Charlotte have violations for their mistreatment of these animals. They also lack veterinary care on an ongoing basis. These animals feel pain and crave socialization just like we do.

I once went to a circus as a child and like a lot of things I’ve learned, just because something is seen as traditional doesn’t mean it is right. I’m not only an animal advocate, but I’m also a local educator in a middle school, and I see the ongoing efforts we use to teach children kindness. I think we have that duty to extend that kindness to all beings. Many cities, including Asheville, have banned wild animals in circuses that visit their city, which sends a message that they don’t condone violence to animals. That is a message that we could also be sending here in Charlotte. Please support the ban of animals in circuses that are visiting our City.

Ceres McMillion, 5227 Grass Ridge Drive said I am a single mother of two. I work a fulltime job, and Charlotte has been my home for 20-years. I'm here to support the proposed ban on performing animal acts. First and foremost, I would like to speak on the misconception that some folks have regarding people who fight for animal’s rights. We are not apathetic to human lives; the welfare of animals is not our sole concern. A lot of us are simple, hardworking people who volunteer at schools, homeless shelters, and churches.

It is past time our City leaders listen to us soldiers, the people who elected you because we believed in you. I am not sure if the Mayor is aware that anyone who tries to contact you on this matter using the link on your Facebook post has been turned down. We are not asking you to vote on gun control laws, abortion laws, or death penalty; this is much simpler. Tigers, bears, elephants and other wild animals do not belong in a circus. These animals need space to roam; they are separated from their social groups and families. Yes, they have families and kept in cages where they can hardly walk, then they are forced to perform for a crowd of screaming people under blinking lights and loud music, besides the fact in order to teach them those cute tricks trainers use taser guns, bullhooks, and other painful methods. No wonder there are so many incidents where bears, lions, and elephants turn on the trainers and the audience, besides the fact that they carry tuberculosis and other diseases that can be spread to the public. Fifty countries around the world and 155 jurisdictions in the US have bans to protect these animals. It is our moral duty and obligation to do what is right and set an example for the younger generation. Lastly, I urge all voters to pay close attention to local elections and how present leaders handle our concerns. Compassion is a key to a better society, and it starts right here with us.
Homeless Awareness Month

Angie Forde, 1510 East 7th Street said as you know my name is Angie Forde, and I’m an advocate on behalf of people who are homeless and for affordable housing. I’m also a member of the Homeless Services Network, and every year around this time I show up in here to remind you that homelessness remains a deadly issue that we as a community must continue to work together to end. We are grateful to all of you, especially Councilmembers Mayfield and Harlow and the staff of the Housing and Neighborhood Services Department for your leadership and partnership efforts to provide and preserve housing for people earning low incomes in Charlotte. Unfortunately, however, the number of people living in places not fit for human habitation keeps increasing, and our shelters continue to overflow, signs that we are not effectively tackling the root causes of homelessness being experienced by our people.

About 48 neighbors who died this year from the community of people who are homeless which is sadly up from 31 last year. Thirteen were still waiting to be housed at the time of their death, and four of them were murdered. We at HSN promise that we will continue to work with you to improve the systems that are meant to protect our most vulnerable from bearing along the burdens that so many of our policies and programs inflict on them and to work to invent creative ways of making sure that we share the bounty that comes to this City with those who are often displaced and exploited in consequence. One of my colleagues reminds me that we can judge the quality of the community’s decisions and goals by the value placed on the lives of the most vulnerable community members.

Mayor Lyles said you will get a follow-up report from the City Manager’s Office, and Council will be copied on that report, and we will continue to work with our various governmental partners and do our very best to serve everyone in this community in a way that is equitable and fair.

********

CONSENT AGENDA

Motion was made by Councilmember Driggs, seconded by Councilmember Bokhari, and carried unanimously to approve the Consent Agenda as printed with the exception of Item Nos. 34, 35, 11, 64, 65, 67, and 52.

The following items were approved:

Item No. 23: Citywide Wash Products and Services for Trucks, Equipment and Rail Cars
(A) Approve a unit price contract to the lowest responsive bidder, Loyal Systems, Inc. for the purchase of truck and train wash products and services for an initial term of three years, and (B) Authorize the City Manager to renew the contract for up to two, one-year terms with possible price adjustments and to amend the contract consistent with the purpose for which the contract was approved.

Summary of Bids
Loyal Systems $69,518.71
Chemstation $139,032.81

Item No. 24: Construct Storm Water Repairs and Improvements
Approve a contract in the amount of $2,306,836 to the lowest responsive bidder, Onsite Development, LLC for the Storm Water Repairs and Improvements Fiscal Year 2020 E project.

Summary of Bids
Onsite Development, LLC $2,306,836.00
Blythe Development Company $2,365,242.75
United of Carolinas, Inc. $3,887,310.18
Item No. 25: Asphalt and Concrete Repair Services
(A) Approve a unit price contract with Barry Brown dba Barry’s Concrete and Service Inc. for asphalt and concrete repair services for an initial term of two years, and (B) Authorize the City Manager to renew the contract for up to two, one-year terms with possible priced adjustments and to amend the contract consistent with the purpose for which the contract was approved.

Item No. 26: Cooperative Purchasing Contracts for Vehicles and Equipment
(A) Approve unit price contract for a cooperative contract, (B) Approve unit price contract for Citywide contracts with the following vendors for the purchase of vehicles and equipment for a term of one year under the North Carolina Sheriff’s Association (NCSA): Performance Ford (NSCA Contract 19-05-0911), Capital Ford of Raleigh, Modern Chevrolet, Modern Nissan, and Piedmont Truck Center (NCSA Contract 20-06-0911) Jet-Vac Equipment Co., Inc. and Southern Vac (NCSA Contract 20-04-0506) (C) Approve unit price contracts as Citywide contracts with the following vendors for the purchase of vehicles and equipment for a term of one year under Sourcewell: Carolina Tractor (Sourcewell Contract 032119-CAT) Clark Equipment Company (Sourcewell Contract 040319-CEC) and (D) Authorize the City Manager to extend the contracts for additional terms as long as the cooperative contracts are in effect, at prices and terms that are the same or more favorable than those offered under the cooperative contact.

Item No. 27: McAlpine Creek Wastewater Treatment Plant Grit System Upgrades
Approve a contract in the amount of $4,960,000 to the lowest responsive bidder, The Harper Corporation – General Contractors for McAlpine Creek Wastewater Treatment Plant Grit System Upgrade project.

Summary of Bids
Harper Corporation $4,960,000.00
State Utility $5,627,000.00

Item No. 28: Preliminary Engineering for Thermal Hydrolysis Process System
(A) Approve a contract for up to $2,863,950 with CDM Smith, Inc., for preliminary engineering for the Thermal Hydrolysis Process Facility at the McAlpine Creek Water Treatment Plant, and (B) Authorize the City Manager to amend the contract consistent with the purpose for which the contract was approved.

Item No. 29: Soil and Debris Hauling Services
(A) Approve unit price contracts with the following companies for soil and debris hauling services for an initial term of three years: McGirt Trucking Co., Silverback Brothers, LLC, Topps Premier Incorporated, and (B) Authorize the City Manager to renew the contracts for up to two, one-year terms with possible price adjustments and to amend the contracts consistent with the purpose for which the contracts were approved.

Item No. 30: Airport Domestic Water Line Interconnection
(A) Reject the low-bid submitted by Cam-Ful Industries, Inc. for the Domestic Water Line Interconnection project, and (B) approve a contract in the amount of $3,228,500 to the lowest responsive bidder Brown Industries, Inc. DBA Precision Plumbing for the Domestic Water Line Interconnection project.

Summary of Bids
*Camful Industries, Inc. $2,744,073.00
Brown Industries, Inc. dba Precision Plumbing $3,228,500.00

*Cam-ful Industries, Inc. was found to be non-responsive due to not meeting CBI goals.

Item No. 31: Airport Centralized Receiving and Distribution Center Construction
Approve a contract in the amount of $19,055,000 to the lowest responsive bidder, Walbridge Southeast, LLC for the construction of a Centralized Receiving and Distribution Center.
Summary of Bids

- Walbridge                     $19,055,000
- Edison Foard                     $20,260,000
- Shiel Sexton                     $20,819,780
- Archer Western                     $21,441,000
- Branch Builds                    $21,515,000
- Cleveland                      $22,484,000
- Edifice, Inc.                      $22,958,000
- Randolph & Son                     $23,581,550

Item No. 32: Airport Passenger Assistance Service Contract
Approve contract amendment #4 with prospect Airport Services, Inc. for Airport Passenger Assistance Services,

Item No. 33: Airport Passenger Loading Bridge Parts and Equipment
(A) Approve the purchase of passenger loading bridge parts and equipment, by the sole source exemption, (B) Approve a contract with JBT Aerotech Corporation for the purchase of passenger loading bridge parts and equipment for an initial term of three years, and (C) Authorize the City Manager to renew the contract for up to two, one-year terms with possible price adjustments and to amend the contract consistent with the purpose for which the contract was approved.

Item No. 36: Oracle Products and Related Services
(A) Approve the purchase of Oracle products and related services from a cooperative contract, (B) Approve a unit price contract with DLT Solutions, LLC for the purchase of Oracle products and services for a term of four years under OMNIA Partners Contract #180233-001, (C) Approve a unit price contract with Mythics, Inc. for the purchase of Oracle products and services for a term of four years under OMNIA Partners contract #180233-002, (D) Authorize the City Manager to extend the contract for additional terms as long as the cooperative contract is in effect, at prices and terms that are the same or more favorable than those offered under the cooperate contract.

Item No. 37: Public Safety Communications Network Maintenance Support, and Upgrades
(A) Approve an amendment to a contract with Motorola Solutions, LLC for the company to provide maintenance, support, and upgrades to the City’s Public Safety Communications Network for a term of seven years, (B) Approve the purchase of public safety network equipment and software, by the sole source exemption, (C) Authorize the City Manager to approve amendments consistent with the City’s use of the system, and (D) Authorize the City Manager to extend the contract for up to two, one-year terms with possible price adjustments and to amend the contract consistent with the purpose for which the contract was approved.

Item No. 38: Refund of Property Taxes
Adopt a resolution authorizing the refund of property taxes assess through clerical or assessment error in the amount of $5,509.24.

The resolution is recorded in full in Resolution Book 50, at Page(s) 315-316.

Item No. 39: Meeting Minutes
Approve the titles, motions, and votes reflected in the Clerk’s record as the minutes of October 14, 2019, Business Meeting and October 21, 2019 Special/Zoning Meeting.

PROPERTY TRANSACTIONS

Item No. 40: In Rem Remedy 10025 Dillard Valley Road
Adopt Ordinance No. 9695-X authorizing the use of In Rem Remedy to demolish and remove the structure at 10025 Dillard Valley Road (Neighborhood Profile Area 84).

The ordinance is recorded in full in Ordinance Book 62, at Page(s) 647.
November 25, 2019
Business Meeting
Minutes Book 148, Page 1119

Item No. 41: In Rem Remedy 5801 Third Street (Mobile Home)
Adopt Ordinance No. 9696-X authorizing the use of In Rem Remedy to demolish and remove the structure at 5801 Third Street – Mobile Home) Neighborhood Profile Area 190).

The ordinance is recorded in full in Ordinance Book 62, at Page(s) 648.

Item No. 42: In Rem Remedy 5801 Third Street (Non-Residential Building Code)
Adopt Ordinance No. 9697-X authorizing the use of In Rem Remedy to demolish and remove the structure at 5801 Third Street -NRBC (Neighborhood Profile Area 190).

The ordinance is recorded in full in Ordinance Book 62, at Page(s) 649.

Item No. 43: Property Transactions – Beaverdam Creek Interceptor Phase 1, Parcel #2
Acquisition of 104,674 square feet (2.403 acre) in Sanitary Sewer Easement, plus 4,054 square feet (0.093 acre) in Temporary Construction Easement at Garrison Road from Burris Holdings, LLC for $40,900 for Beaverdam Creek Interceptor Phase 1, Parcel #2.

Item No. 44: Property Transaction – Camp North End Capital Improvement Project, Parcel #45
Acquisition of 2,185 square feet (0.05 acre) in Fee Simple, 2701 square feet (0.062 acre) in Utility Easement, 1754 square feet (0.04 acre) Sidewalk Utility Easement at 1609 North Graham Street from Mecklenburg County ABC Board for $71,675 for Camp North End Capital Improvement Project, Parcel #45.

Item No. 45: Property Transactions – Edgewater Drive to Rosecrest Drive Sanitary Sewer Replacement, Parcel #51
Acquisition of 2,332.08 square feet (0.054 acre) in Sanitary Sewer Easement, plus 7,942.44 square feet (0.182 acre) in Temporary Construction Easement at 6500 Wisteria Drive from Archdale DNB, LLC and East Lake Associates 2, LLC for $25,425 for Edgewater Drive to Rosecrest Drive Sanitary Sewer Replacement, Parcel #51.

Item No. 46: Property Transactions – Lakeview-Reames Intersection Improvements, Parcel #59
Acquisition of 2,405 square feet (0.055 acre) in Fee Simple, 1,003 square feet (0.023 acre) in Sidewalk and Utility Easement, plus 5,392 square feet (0.124 acre) in Temporary Construction Easement at Lakeview Road and Reames Road from Reames Investment Corporation for $115,000 for Lakeview-Reames Intersection Improvements, Parcel #59.

Item No. 47: Property Transactions – Lakeview Road Farm to Market, Parcel #4
Resolution of Condemnation of 445 square feet (0.01 acre) in Sidewalk and Utility Easement, plus 3,250 square feet (0.075 acre) in Temporary Construction Easement, plus 1,915 square feet (0.044 acre) in Utility Easement at 8431 Statesville Road from U. S. 21 Holding Company, LLC for an amount to be determined for Lakeview Farm to Market, Parcel #4.

The resolution is recorded in full in Resolution Book 50, at Page(s) 318.

Item No. 48: Property Transactions – Lakeview Road Farm to Market Parcel #5
Resolution of Condemnation of 5,418 square feet (0.124 acre) in Storm Drainage Easement, plus 18,190 square feet (0.418 acre) in Sidewalk and Utility Easement, plus 11,571 square feet (0.266 acre) in Temporary Construction Easement, plus 1,005 square feet (0.023 acre) in Utility Easement at 5905 Lakeview Road and 8500 Statesville Road from U. S. 21 Holding Company, LLC for an amount to be determined for Lakeview Road Farm to Market, Parcel #5.

The resolution is recorded in full in Resolution Book 50, at Page(s) 319.
Item No. 49: Property Transactions – Lakeview Road Farm to Market, Parcel #7
Resolution of Condemnation of 1,731 square feet (0.04 acre) in Storm Drainage Easement, plus 6,920 square feet (0.159 acre) in Sidewalk and Utility Easement, plus 9,386 square feet (0.215 acre) in Temporary Construction Easement at 6051 Lakeview Road from Eastgroup Properties, L.P. for an amount to be determined for Lakeview Road Farm to Market, Parcel #7.

The resolution is recorded in full in Resolution Book 50, at Page(s) 320.

Item No. 50: Property Transactions – Lakeview Road Farm to Market, Parcel #8
Resolution of Condemnation of 3,679 square feet (0.084 acre) in Sidewalk and Utility Easement, plus 3,114 square feet (0.071 acre) in Temporary Construction Easement at 6125 and 6135 Lakeview Road from SCG Harris Ridge, LLC for an amount to be determined for Lakeview Road Farm to Market, Parcel #8.

The resolution is recorded in full in Resolution Book 50, at Page(s) 321.

Item No. 51: Property Transactions – Lakeview Road Farm to Market, Parcel #9
Acquisition of 2,440 square feet (0.056 acre) in Storm Drainage Easement, 1,311 square feet (0.03 acre) in Sidewalk and Utility Easement, 2,724 square feet (0.063 acre) in Temporary Construction Easement at 6415 Lakeview Road from M.I.K.E. Land Co., LLC for $38,725 for Lakeview Road Farm to Market, Parcel #9

Item No. 53: Property Transactions – Lakeview Road Farm to Market, Parcel #17
Acquisition of 400 square feet (0.009 acre) in Fee Simple, 499 square feet (0.011 acre) in Storm Drainage Easement, and 5,142 square feet (0.118 acre) in Temporary Construction Easement at 6124 and 6134 Lakeview Road from State Employees' Credit Union for $18,900 for Lakeview Road Farm to Market, Parcel #17.

Item No. 54: Property Transactions – Lakeview Road Farm to Market, Parcel #19
Acquisition of 362 square feet (0.008 acre) in Sidewalk and Utility Easement, plus 5,192 square feet (0.119 acre) in Temporary Construction Easement at 6300 Lakeview Road from John W. Markham and Barbara D. Markham for $26,192 for Lakeview Road Farm to Market, Parcel #19.

Item No. 55: Property Transactions – Oakhurst – Amity Gardens Street Connector, Parcel #1
Acquisition of 31,883 square feet (0.732 acre) in Fee Simple at 4831 Monroe Road from Elaine Hailey, for $435,000 for Oakhurst-Amity Garden Street Connector, Parcel #1.

Item No. 56: Property Transactions – Queen City Drive Sidewalk, Paracel #1
Acquisition of 4,539 square feet (0.104 acre) in Storm Drainage Easement, plus 1,536 square feet (0.035 acre) in Sidewalk and Utility Easement, plus 1,385 square feet (0.032 acre) in Temporary Construction Easement at 3540 Tuckaseegee Road from Pankaj Patel and the Trustees of the David E. Fuller, Sr. Trust dated June 13, 1997 for $26,650 for Queen City Drive Sidewalk, Parcel #1.

Item No. 57: Property Transactions – Tom Hunter Streetscape, Parcel #10
Acquisition of 4,312 square feet (0.099 acre) Fee simple in existing right-of-way, 450 square feet (0.01 acre) in Storm Drainage easement, 1850 square feet (0.042 acre) in Sidewalk Utility Easement, 4440 square feet (0.102 acre) in Temporary Construction Easement at 400 Tom Hunter Road from Iglesia Cristiana Pentecostal Cristo Mi Redentor for $16,736 for Tom Hunter Streetscape, Parcel #10.

Item No. 58: Property Transactions – Water Oak Storm Drainage Improvements, Parcel #1
Acquisition of 1,096 square feet (0.025 acre) in Storm Drainage Easement, plus 881 square feet (0.02 acre) in Existing Storm Drainage Easement at 816 Judith Court from Elaine Poston Brooks Revocable Trust for $15,417 for Water Oak Storm Drainage Improvements, Parcel #1.
Item No. 59: Property Transactions – Water Oak Storm Drainage Improvements, Parcel #11
Acquisition of 1,501 square feet (0.034 acre) in Storm Drainage Easement, plus 471 square feet (0.011 acre) in Temporary Construction Easement, plus 203 square feet (0.005 acre) in Utility Easement, plus 2,267 square feet (0.052 acre) in Existing Storm Drainage Easement at 1018 Linda Lane from Sally K. Shaw for Water Oak Storm Drainage Improvements, Parcel #11.

Item No. 60: Property Transactions – Water Oak Storm Drainage Improvements, Parcel #15
Acquisition of 406 square feet (0.009 acre) in Storm Drainage Easement, plus 45 square feet (0.001 acre) in Temporary Construction Easement, plus 15 square feet in Utility Easement, plus 769 square feet (0.018 acre) in Existing Storm Drainage Easement at 1009 Brantham Court from Clay Durkin and Linda Durkin for $12,600 for Water Oak Storm Drainage Improvements, Parcel #15.

Item No. 61: Property Transactions – Water Oak Storm Drainage Improvements, Parcel #16
Acquisition of 3,318 square feet (0.076 acre) in Storm Drainage Easement, plus 322 square feet (0.007 acre) in Temporary Construction Easement, plus 2 square feet in Utility Easement, plus 831 square feet (0.019 acre) in Existing Storm Drainage Easement at 1001 Brantham Court from Erica M. Hetrick for $48,150 for Water Oak Storm Drainage Improvements, Parcel #16.

Item No. 62: Property Transactions – Water Oak Storm Drainage Improvements, Parcel #17
Resolution of Condemnation of 1,612 square feet (0.037 acre) in Storm Drainage Easement, plus 801 square feet (0.018 acre) in Existing Storm Drainage Easement at 1008 Brantham Court from Christopher Blain Jenkins, for $24,400 for Water Oak Storm Drainage Improvements, Parcel #17.

The resolution is recorded in full in Resolution Book 50, at Page(s) 323.

Item No. 63: Property Transactions – Water Oak Storm Drainage Improvements, Parcel #25
Resolution of Condemnation of 7,951 square feet (0.183 acre) in Storm Drainage Easement, plus 1,530 square feet (0.035 acre) in Waterline Easement, plus 3,011 square feet (0.069 acre) in Temporary Construction Easement, plus 1,947 square feet (0.045 acre) in Utility Easement at 4808 Water Oak Road from Water Oak NC Partners, LLC for $43,150 for Water Oak Storm Drainage Improvements, Parcel #25.

The resolution is recorded in full in Resolution Book 50, at Page(s) 324.

Item No. 66: Property Transactions – Water Oak Storm Drainage Improvements, Parcel #38
Resolution of Condemnation of 11,731 Square feet (0.269 acre) in Storm Drainage Easement, plus 2,053 square feet (0.047 acre) in Waterline Easement, plus 11,720 (0.269 acre) in Temporary Construction Easement, plus 2,172 square feet (0.05 acre) in Utility Easement at 500 North Sharon Amity Road from Charlotte Masonic Temple Association for an amount to be determined for Water Oak Storm Drainage Improvements, Parcel #38.

The resolution is recorded in full in Resolution Book 50, at Page(s) 325.

Item No. 68: Property Transactions – West Boulevard Corridor Implementation – Morning Drive and Ridge Avenue, Parcel #3
Resolution of Condemnation of 440 square feet (0.01 acre) in Sidewalk and Utility Easement, plus 243 square feet (0.006 acre) in Temporary Construction Easement, plus 47 square feet (0.001 acre) in Bust Stop Easement at 2311 West Boulevard from The Reid Family Trust for an amount to be determined for West Boulevard Corridor Implementation – Morning Drive and Ridge Avenue, Parcel #3.
ITEM NO. 34: AIRPORT WEBSITE AND MOBILE APPLICATION SERVICE PROVIDER AGREEMENT

Councilmember Mayfield said my question was regarding the fact that this particular company, which is located in Amsterdam, was the sub-contractor, and I was inquiring, since we keep sharing that our focus is to help local community, why would we create an opportunity in which we would create a waiver to approve moving forward with the sub-contractor on this particular project with estimated expenditure of a little over $700,000 opposed to putting the full contract for the digital service out to bid and potentially having at minimum a company located within the United States being able to possibly be awarded when not even having the opportunity to be awarded?

Councilmember Mayfield said my question was regarding the fact that this particular company, which is located in Amsterdam, was the sub-contractor, and I was inquiring, since we keep sharing that our focus is to help local community, why would we create an opportunity in which we would create a waiver to approve moving forward with the sub-contractor on this particular project with estimated expenditure of a little over $700,000 opposed to putting the full contract for the digital service out to bid and potentially having at minimum a company located within the United States being able to possibly be awarded when not even having the opportunity to be awarded?

Haley Gentry, Aviation said I spoke with Ms. Mayfield earlier, and she was inquiring about why M2Mobi and where they are based. M2Mobi was part of a contract that was approved by you in 2017; they were a sub-contractor to a company that was based in Atlanta, named InFax. The sub-contractor, their work has been escalating with the Airport; they were put together as part of a team. They are one of only a handful in the world that provided integrated platform that provides what you see in the Terminal Building on our digital screen as well as the apt in the website design. All of those things are integrated. I would encourage you to take a look at the apt if you have done so, and you will recognize that it is a look and feel that you have seen in the Terminal Building. We have been running into issues with InFax in terms of their ability to keep up with the work that M2Mobie has been providing us, and at their request, they have asked to back out of in between the two of us. So, they have been the middle man so to speak, and we got their blessing and agreement and wanted to continue the service that we had and continue working on the projects that are underway at this time. That is why the contract is before you this evening and that is why M2Mobie is being recommended. I would also add that M2Mobie is one of the leaders in the industry for this. There are probably other people who can do apt and web development; however, they have quite the reputation throughout the world; they service other airports like Obie Dobie, Duplin, Schiphol, Orlando, Dallas-Fort Worth. That is a handful just to give you some idea of what they are doing.

Ms. Mayfield said Mr. Manager, I would like for us to take into consideration that we had no sub-contracting opportunities on this, but what we had is a company that bid it, and their sub-contractor has done excellent work according to staff and what we created but yet, they did not turn around and create an opportunity for sub-contracting work, at least to have sub-contracting work here since. Again, they are headquartered out of Amsterdam, and what we had was a US company, even though it was not in the City of Charlotte, that was the prime work with a sub-contractor. The sub-contractor is now moving in, because we created a waiver. There are no sub-contracting opportunities. We have IT related and other pieces of this that can be shared, because that is how they came in, impact to intent. Our language says that we have a goal of diversifying as well as looking at all opportunities through an equity lens. I am not going to motion for approval; I am going to be voting no against this. My colleagues may be voting in support of it, but I’m voting no against it, because the opportunity they had by coming in as a sub-contractor is not being allowed or afforded for another company to be able to grow in our City. So, oppose to me moving to deny, I will leave it for one of my colleagues if they want to motion to approve, but I will not be voting for it.

Motion was made by Councilmember Bokhari, seconded by Councilmember Driggs, to (A) Approve a contract with M2Mobie for the Airport website and mobile application for an initial term of three years, and (B) Authorize the City Manager to renew the contract for up to two, one-year terms with possible price adjustments and to amend the contract consistent with the purpose for which the contract was approved.
November 25, 2019  
Business Meeting  
Minutes Book 148, Page 1123

**Councilmember Mitchell** said so, you didn’t issue an RFP?

Ms. Gentry said initially there was an RFP process where they brought in as a sub-contractor to the prime in 2017.

Mr. Mitchell said but then you removed the one who was in between, and you didn’t feel the need to issue another RFP for this contract?

Ms. Gentry said we are actually in the middle of quite a bit of work with them trying to make our product ADA compliant in all aspects, which is in conjunction with the Citywide initiative that is going on, and that is where the prime was struggling to manage the workload and struggling to keep up with the amount of work that they were doing. So, it was discussed at that time to keep the project moving forward and to enable us to continue this ADA work that the prime would back out, and we would contract directly with M2Mobi.

Mr. Mitchell said but you shared with us there are other companies who have the same ability.

Ms. Gentry said there are other companies that have the same ability to do website, but the integrated platform that they provide is really one of very few in the country, really in the world that I know of, and I would have to go back to the original documents to be able to give you more details on those integrated platforms, but that is what separated them from the others when we went through the first process.

Mr. Mitchell said Ms. Mayfield brought up a point; they came in through a sub-contractor relationship. So, why are we issuing a contract, and we’ve taken that sub-contracting ability away on this one.

Ms. Gentry said initially, we went through a proposal process where they assembled teams, and there were four or five different proposers at that, and they brought in their own unique team to sell us on the project that we were accomplishing. We selected at that time and recommended to you who we through was the best team and that is how we got M2Mobie now.

**Councilmember Ajmera** said in our notes it says that there is a propriety all-in-one platform; was that one of the reasons for not having sub-contracting opportunities? I’m just to understand.

Ms. Gentry said yes, they are a relatively small boutique firm, and as I mentioned, that is not a platform that everybody was able to present to us. That is a platform that they developed and is very unique in the industry.

Ms. Ajmera said I understand my colleague’s perspective on this, especially creating opportunities for other businesses, but I also understand the explanation that you have here in terms of proprietary information, and I’m not sure if that led to eliminating sub-contracting or not having any. If we can get more information about that, if this is the reason that we are not doing sub-contracting then I would support it. I understand the proprietary information and the software development, but if it is just one part of the whole software process than we’ve got to look at sub-contracting as my colleagues Ms. Mayfield and Mr. Mitchell had mentioned.

Ms. Mayfield said for clarification for what I think I heard my colleague ask, in 2017 we submitted an RFP app. We had a company according to what we requested in our RFP; we had a number of applications that came in along with the fact that they had to meet MWSBE goals. Who was selected? Chose a company, how we got SBE or MWSBE goals out of a company out of Amsterdam, I don’t know. I’m not going back to 2017, but in the meantime in the year and a half to two years that we have been working with two companies the sub-contractor, we have been adding on and giving them greater opportunity based on where we are growing in the City. You in essence had access to Charlotte Douglas International Airport system, access of conversations of where we are
tending to grow and wanting to integrate so to then say today this is one of the better solutions, because they have a level of proprietary expertise; they’ve had access to our system; therefore, they have been able to create a platform to meet what we are now saying we are wanting.

I need to make sure that Council is very clear about the conversation that we are having because when we first noted that there were challenges with the prime, one, the Manager’s Office should have been notified if Council wasn’t notified, because there should have been a conversation right then regarding how do we move forward. What is the process if a sub-contractor actually excels beyond the prime. Is there legal- Is there financial obligations of the prime? If it was a construction project, you would be hit with fines for not being able to keep up with the project. What is the conversation when we are talking about cyberspace and internet, but yet again, it is still the conversation of you had access to learn the system. You created and potentially recommended hey, we can also do this along with, and here is what we can do for you. That still eliminated the ability for another company to have the same opportunity that this company did as a sub-contractor. So, to then come back and say a year and a half later, we now want to move forward directly with the sub-contractor but not provide any information of the previous contract, there is nothing in here outside of the estimated expenditures to be $703,000. Nothing is noted regarding the 2017 contract; What was the total amount of that contract. How much of that contract was paid to the prime before we severed that relationship to then focus specifically on the sub-contractor. How much is the balance from the original contract, and is that payout in addition to this new $703,000 amount, or is the $703,000 amount the difference from ending the first contract and starting a new contract? There are multiple questions that are layered in this particular request that are questions that honestly should have been discussed when you first learned that the prime was not able to do their job.

Ms. Gentry said Ms. Mayfield, may I clarify one thing I said to you? InFax, who is the prime, provides numerous services to us, and they have been providing those services very capably. What they have not been able to do, nor did they have this expertise to start with is providing the web and the apt services. They brought M2Mobie, because they are the industry leader for aviation in this technology; they brought them to the table to do that, and in the beginning when they formed this partnership it was like having the dream team for all that was going to be provided, and the work has been so significant that they are at a point where we would like them to be out of that, and they would like to be out of it as the middle man.

Ms. Mayfield said so in essence, we are separating the contract.

Ms. Gentry said yes.

The vote was taken on the motion to approve and was recorded as follows:

YEAS: Councilmembers Ajmera Bokhari, Driggs, Egleston, Eiselt, Harlow, Phipps and Winston.
NAYS: Councilmembers Mayfield, Mitchell and Newton.

* * * * * *

ITEM NO. 35: LONG-TERM INVESTMENT PROGRAM INVESTMENT CONSULTANT SERVICES

Councilmember Mayfield said Mr. Manager again, and I said it in the other room, but I do want to note it in this room as well. You hit the ground running when coming to the City of Charlotte, and there have been a lot of not only relationship changes but staff changes. To me, I believe the ideals and the goals of the City of Charlotte, and I want to thank you for that, but you know I always have to ask us to think a little differently, and if we are working towards an equity lens over how we govern and how we create opportunities for the City of Charlotte, this request for the long-term investment program for consultant services, the company that we have identified, where we are saying it is
around $120,000 estimated expenditures annually and we are also asking for your office, either you or future Managers for the office to be able to expend this contract up to two additional times, there is a five percent MWSBE goal, with it being broken out that five percent between five different companies, but what we are asking for is to provide investment consulting services for the City’s long-term investment program and assist with fiduciary oversight of the City’s existing deferred compensation programs and the investment plan for the retiree health care plan. Now, over the years, and Councilmember Mitchell please correct me if I’m wrong, but as Chair of the Economic Development, we have had minority owned, financial companies come in and speak to not only the Economic Development Committee but also have attempted over the years to build relationships with staff. We had an opportunity that opposed to looking at the minority business, the WBE, the SBE or the MBE as a sub-contractor, we had an opportunity in this role for us to have identified an MWSBE owned prime. Until we can figure out a way to level that playing field and stop only looking at minority business participation and access as a sub-contracting opportunity but as a contracting opportunity, we are still doing a disservice to the community. Having a total five percent goal that is split up between multiple smaller businesses for a contract that may be $120,000 annually, we have an opportunity for staff to re-think how they are seeking out RFPs that come in utilizing that equity lens. Again, I am not going to be able to support this; that is why but, I hope that the message of the importance of an equity lens and how we govern and how we do business and who has excess to do business in the City of Charlotte is something that was seriously not only be taken into consideration but will be implemented.

**Councilmember Eiselt** said Mr. Manager, the LTIP is a program that Charlotte created. Is that correct?

**Marcus Jones, City Manager** said I will have the CFO come up to speak a little bit about what we are doing here.

**Kelly Flannery, Chief Financial Officer** said that is correct; it was created in 2007.

Ms. Eiselt said I just wondered if this particular consulting company had anything to do with creating the program, because it is different than the State I believe. Is that right? The City chose not to participate in the State investment program for deferred compensation.

Ms. Flannery said there are three things this contract will do, the LTIP, which is the [inaudible] piece of our investments as well as our two deferred compensation plans. We also have one with the state as well. The employee can choose where they want to participate.

Ms. Eiselt said were Marquette Associates part of creating this plan?

Ms. Flannery said no.

---

**Motion was made by Councilmember Bokhari, seconded by Councilmember Driggs, to (A) Authorize the City Manager to negotiate and approve a unit price contract with Marquette Associates, Inc, for Long-Term Investment Program Consulting Services for an initial term of three years, and (B) Authorize the City Manager to renew the contract for up to two, one-year terms with possible price adjustments and to amend the contract consistent with the purpose for which the contract was approved.**

---

The vote was taken on the motion to approve and was recorded as follows:

**YEAS:** Councilmembers Ajmera Bokhari, Driggs, Egleston, Eiselt, Harlow, Mitchell, Newton, Phipps and Winston.

**NAYS:** Councilmember Mayfield.

* * * * * * *
PUBLIC HEARING

ITEM NO. 12: PUBLIC HEARING ON PROPOSED ANALYSIS OF IMPEDIMENTS TO FAIR HOUSING REPORT

Mayor Lyles declared the hearing open.

There being no speakers either for or against, a motion was made by Councilmember Egleston and seconded by Councilmember Newton to close the public hearing regarding approval of a proposed Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Report.

Mayor Lyles said this report is online and is available. It does have an executive summary, and the Council will take action on adoption of the Fair Housing Report as required by the federal government on December 9th.

A vote was taken on the motion and carried unanimously.

* * * * * * *

ITEM NO. 13: PUBLIC HEARING ON A RESOLUTION TO CLOSE A PORTION OF NORTH POPLAR STREET

Mayor Lyles declared the hearing open.

There being no speakers either for or against, a motion was made by Councilmember Egleston, seconded by Councilmember Newton, and carried unanimously to (A) close the public hearing and (B) Adopt a resolution to close a portion of North Poplar Street.

The resolution is recorded in full in Resolution Book 50, at Page(s) 311-314.

* * * * * * *

ITEM NO. 14: PUBLIC HEARING AND DECISION ON CHEYNEY PHASE 5 VOLUNTARY ANNEXATION

There being no speakers either for or against, a motion was made by Councilmember Egleston, seconded by Councilmember Newton, and carried unanimously to (A) close the public hearing and (B) Adopt Ordinance No. 9689-X with an effective date of November 25, 2019, to extend the corporate limits to include the property and assign it to the adjacent City Council District 4.

The ordinance is recorded in full in Ordinance Book 62, at Page(s) 630-634.

* * * * * * *

ITEM NO. 15: PUBLIC HEARING AND DECISION ON PORTER’S ROW VOLUNTARY ANNEXATION

Mayor Lyles declared the hearing open.

There being no speakers either for or against, a motion was made by Councilmember Egleston, seconded by Councilmember Newton, and carried unanimously to (A) close the public hearing and (B) Adopt Ordinance No. 9690-X with an effective date of November 25, 2019, to extend the corporate limits to include this property and assign it to the adjacent City Council District 3.
ITEM NO. 16: PUBLIC HEARING AND DECISION ON SUTTON FARMS PHASE 3 VOLUNTARY ANNEXATION

There being no speakers either for or against, a motion was made by Councilmember Egleston, seconded by Councilmember Newton, and carried unanimously to Close the public hearing.

There being no speakers either for or against, a motion was made by Councilmember Winston, seconded by Councilmember Newton, and carried unanimously to adopt Ordinance No. 9691-X with an effective date of November 25, 2019, to extend the corporate limits to include these properties and assign them to the adjacent City Council District 2.

The ordinance is recorded in full in Ordinance Book 62, at Page(s) 640-643.

ITEM NO. 17: CITY MANAGER’S REPORT

Marcus Jones, City Manager said I have two items for you tonight; one is the 30-day memo, which at the next Council Action Review, which will be December 9th we will have the follow-up for you with the Charlotte Business INClusion and Procurement process. You may recall that there was a number of questions about a supply contract that we had before you beforehand and then an update on the Transit Operations. In the folder and for those of you who resisted to open until now, thank you. What we have, and I would like to commend the Communications Department, and thank you for putting this together. It is really two-years of work for the various committees, and as you start to go through it, if we go back to the previous year, and it is the cart that I believe you received during the Retreat, it speaks about all of the accomplishments as well as how they align with the goals in The Charlotte Winds and then over the course of this past year the re-convened Committees and all the work that has come out of there. So, we think it is a great opportunity for the Councilmembers to share with the community and all the hard work that has occurred in the Committees over the last two-years.

Mayor Lyles said Mr. Jones; I think this is great for all of us to have this kind of information. Sometimes we forget how much we’ve accomplished, and this is a great reminder and I think a great way to share it with the community.

Councilmember Winston said this is very cool, and one suggestion I have is that you can create graphics that can be shared electronically, because this is great right here in front of us but not very easy to disseminate widely. I don’t think it would be transferable one to one, because there are a lot of words on this and doesn’t always work well for on line graphics, but something along this model would be excellent.

ITEM NO. 18: PURCHASE A POLICE TRAINING FACILITY BUILDING

There being no speakers either for or against, a motion was made by Councilmember Egleston, seconded by Councilmember Newton, and carried unanimously to Close the public hearing.

There being no speakers either for or against, a motion was made by Councilmember Winston, seconded by Councilmember Newton, and carried unanimously to adopt Ordinance No. 9691-X with an effective date of November 25, 2019, to extend the corporate limits to include these properties and assign them to the adjacent City Council District 2.

The ordinance is recorded in full in Ordinance Book 62, at Page(s) 635-639.
Mayor Lyles said we so much appreciate the work that the Foundation does for our Officers and the innovation that they encourage for us.

ITEM NO. 19: CONSTRUCT KENILWORTH-ROMANY STORM DRAINAGE IMPROVEMENT PROJECT

Motion was made by Councilmember Egleston, seconded by Councilmember Mitchell, and carried unanimously to (A) Approve the purchase of a Training facility building, by the sole source exemption, (B) Approve a contract with Action Target for the purchase of a Training Facility building in the amount of $1,115,196, and (C) Authorize the City Manager to accept a donation form the Charlotte Mecklenburg Police Foundation in the amount of $500,000 for training facility enhancements.

Mayor Lyles said there’s is going to be a lot of construction going on; I am not sure whose district it is, but I am sure they will be ready. I am sure Mr. Egleston will be ready.

Summary of Bids

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contractor</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hall Contracting Corporation</td>
<td>$18,066,782.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sealand Contractors Corp.</td>
<td>$21,009,297.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oscar Renda Contracting, Inc.</td>
<td>$24,994,123.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United of Carolinas, Inc.</td>
<td>$25,996,742.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blythe Development Company</td>
<td>$26,834,640.80</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Ordinance is recorded in full in Ordinance Book 62, at Page(s) 644.

ITEM NO. 20: FEDERAL FISCAL YEAR 2019 LEAD HAZARD CONTROL GRANT

Motion was made by Councilmember Egleston, seconded by Councilmember Mitchell, and carried unanimously to (A) Approve the purchase of a Training facility building, by the sole source exemption, (B) Approve a contract with Action Target for the purchase of a Training Facility building in the amount of $18,066,782.80 to the lowest response bidder Hall Contracting Corporation for the Kenilworth-Romany Storm Drainage Improvement Project, and (B) Adopt Budget Ordinance No. 9692-X appropriating a reimbursement of $250,620 from the Charlotte Mecklenburg Hospital Authority for storm drainage improvements.

Mayor Lyles said there’s is going to be a lot of construction going on; I am not sure whose district it is, but I am sure they will be ready. I am sure Mr. Egleston will be ready.

Summary of Bids

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contractor</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hall Contracting Corporation</td>
<td>$18,066,782.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sealand Contractors Corp.</td>
<td>$21,009,297.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oscar Renda Contracting, Inc.</td>
<td>$24,994,123.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United of Carolinas, Inc.</td>
<td>$25,996,742.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blythe Development Company</td>
<td>$26,834,640.80</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Ordinance is recorded in full in Ordinance Book 62, at Page(s) 644.

Councilmember Phipps said I know we talked in our Dinner Briefing about some funds also being devoted to this lead abatement, but is this a countywide thing, or is this just City focused? Do we distribute any of these funds to other municipalities or just localized Charlotte only?

Pam Wideman, Director of Housing and Neighborhood Services said this is City wide.

Mayor Lyles said other communities can apply for Community Development Block Grants in these kinds of things as well.

Ms. Wideman said that is correct.
The ordinance is recorded in full in Ordinance Book 62, at Page(s) 645.

* * * * * * *

ITEM NO. 21: APPROPRIATE PRIVATE DEVELOPER FUNDS

Motion was made by Councilmember Mayfield, seconded by Councilmember Newton, and carried unanimously to (A) Approve a developer agreement with Pringle Square, LLC and (B) Adopt Budget Ordinance No. 9694-X appropriating $439,500 in private developer funds for road improvements.

The ordinance is recorded in full in Ordinance Book 62, at Page(s) 646.

* * * * * * *

ITEM NO. 69: ORDINANCE NO. 9698-Z, PETITION NO. 2019-097 BY ARDENT ACQUISITIONS, LLC AMENDING THE OFFICIAL ZONING MAP OF THE CITY OF CHARLOTTE TO AFFECT A CHANGE IN ZONING FOR APPROXIMATELY 17.02 ACRES LOCATED ON THE WEST SIDE OF SOUTH TRYON STREET, SOUTH OF BLAIRHILL ROAD, SOUTH OF CLANTON ROAD, EAST OF I-77 FROM I-1 AND I-1(CD) (LIGHT INDUSTRIAL AND LIGHT INDUSTRIAL, CONDITIONAL) TO TOD-TR (TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT – TRANSIT TRANSITION)

The Zoning Committee voted 6-0 (motion by Ham, seconded by Barbee) to recommend approval of this petition and adopt the following Statement of Consistency: This petition is found to be inconsistent with the Scaleybark Station Area Plan, based on the information from the post hearing staff analysis and the public hearing and because the plan recommends office, industrial-warehouse distribution for this site. However, we find this petition to be reasonable and in the public interest based on information from the post hearing staff analysis and the public hearing and because the subject site is within ½-mile walk of the Scaleybark Transit Station on the LYNX Blue Line. Since the adoption of the plan, TOD development has advanced in the direction of this parcel significantly. Use of conventional TOD-TR (transit-oriented development-neighborhood center) zoning applies standards and regulations to create the desired form and intensity of transit supportive development, and a conditional rezoning is not necessary. TOD (transit-oriented development) standards include requirements for appropriate streetscape treatment, building setbacks, street-facing building walls, entrances, and screening.

Motion was made by Councilmember Mayfield, seconded by Councilmember Mitchell, and carried unanimously to approve Petition No. 2019-097 by Arden Acquisitions, LLC and adopt the following Statement of Consistency: this petition is found to be inconsistent with the Scaleybark Station Area Plan, based on the information from the final staff analysis and the public hearing and because the plan recommends office, industrial-warehouse distribution for this site. However, we find this petition to be reasonable and in the public interest based on information from the final staff analysis and the public hearing and because the subject site is within ½-mile walk of the Scaleybark Transit Station on the LYNX Blue Line. Since the adoption of the plan, TOD development has advanced in the direction of this parcel significantly. Use of conventional TOD-TR (transit-oriented development-neighborhood center) zoning applies standards and regulations to create the desired form and intensity of transit supportive development, and a conditional rezoning is not necessary. TOD (transit-oriented development) standards include requirements for appropriate streetscape treatment, building setbacks, street-facing building walls, entrances, and screening.

Councilmember Mayfield said I just wanted to take a moment to thank the petitioner and he has joined us this evening after being up since 2:00 in the morning. There were concerns that I had regarding TOD as a whole, but there are a lot of commitments made in this project that are I truly believe are going to be good, not only for the residents and
the neighborhood but also to show that it can be done differently without there being a mandate to do it. So, thank you.

The ordinance is recorded in full in Ordinance Book 62, at Page(s) 650-651.

* * * * * * *

ITEM NO. 70: ORDINANCE NO. 9699-Z, PETITION NO. 2019-099 BY TOWNES MOZER AMENDING THE OFFICIAL ZONING MAP OF THE CITY OF CHARLOTTE TO AFFECT A CHANGE IN ZONING FOR APPROXIMATELY 2.33 ACRES LOCATED ON THE SOUTHWEST CORNER OF SOUTH TRYON STREET AND GRIFFITH STREET FROM I-2 (GENERAL INDUSTRIAL) TO TOD-NC (TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT – NEIGHBORHOOD CENTER).

The Zoning Committee voted 6-0 (motion by Gussman, seconded by Barbee) to recommend approval of this petition and adopt the following Statement of Consistency: This petition is found to be inconsistent with the New Bern Station Area Plan, based on the information from the post hearing staff analysis and the public hearing and because: the plan recommends office/industrial-warehouse-distribution land uses. However, we find this petition to be reasonable and in the public interest based on information from the post hearing staff analysis and the public hearing and because the subject site is within ¼ mile of New Bern Station on the LYNX Blue Line. The proposal allows for a duplex or townhome development which provides a transition from the nonresidential uses and larger residential buildings along South Boulevard into the surrounding single-family neighborhood. The building design requirements will help provide compatibility with the surrounding neighborhood. Building design will create useable porches and front entries oriented toward the street which will promote integration with the neighborhood. The proposed development allows for an infill project that provides transition to more intense uses on South Boulevard while minimizing impacts to existing residences due to its location at the edge of the neighborhood on Greystone Rd.

The ordinance is recorded in full in Ordinance Book 62, at Page(s) 652-653.

* * * * * * *

ITEM NO. 22: MAYOR AND CITY COUNCIL TOPICS

Councilmember Mitchell said Happy Thanksgiving to all.

Councilmember Ajmera said Happy Thanksgiving, but I want to take a moment to acknowledge. I had an opportunity to listen to the testimony that our Mayor gave last week on Capitol Hill, and I took great pride as she asked for more support for our SEAP goals.
for our transit goals and for our Charlotte energy goals. I certainly appreciate the work that you did there and appreciated the ask that was followed by that, so thank you Mayor.

Mayor Lyles said thank you very much, and it was great to represent our City, and I’m really proud to be able to do that.

Councilmember Mayfield said I want to specifically thank my colleague Councilmembers Mitchell, Winston, and Egleston who were able to join us for the National League of Cities Conference last week where we had a chance to, not only learn and convene, hence my beautiful little handmade hat as part of just celebrating the culture in Austin and just the diversity and the beauty of it. I was hoping to be able to wear it to the Renaissance Festival, but since Mr. Mitchell let me know that last night was the last night of the Renaissance Festival, I am wearing my beautiful head piece tonight, because it just represents as we are coming into the holidays the fact that so many diverse cultures are represented in not only our City but in our nation. So, as many will be celebrating Thanksgiving a lot will not be celebrating the holiday as Thanksgiving, but people will be gathering together with family and friends. So, I ask for you to reach out to your senior members in your neighborhood; reach out to the elders in the neighborhood, reach out to the elders in your family just to check in on them. You may not have talked to your Great Aunt or Uncle in a while; this will be a great time not to send a text but to actually pick up the phone if you are not able to knock on the door to surprise them and also an opportunity for us to look out for those who are less fortunate, because what we may take for granted as access someone else may be able to receive as a blessing as abundant. I wish you all safe and wonderful holidays filled with love, laughter, and joy.

Councilmember Phipps said we had a speaker earlier today to talk about greenway safety; you’ve probably already heard by now that CMPD has identified two suspects in this case and the Violent Criminal Apprehension Team is more or less looking for these individuals, so I’m hopeful that an arrest will be made soon.

Also, inasmuch as this is my last final appearance at this dais I would like to thank the voters in District 4 for giving me the opportunity over the last three Council terms to serve them. It has truly been an opportunity beyond measurer, and I would also like to thank my lovely wife, Lamare. We celebrated our 36th wedding anniversary last week, and she has definitely had tremendous sacrifice for putting up with me going to all these many meetings and things, so I just wanted to thank her and thank all of my colleagues. I know the City is in good hands, and I thank my newly elected Council Representative Ms. Renee Perkins Johnson who will be filling this seat, and I think we will be able to move on smoothly as we progress with this City in so many different ways. Thank you.

Mayor Lyles said thank you Mr. Phipps, we will have more to say about you soon.

Councilmember Bokhari said I just wanted to thank all of the community that participated in our Upward Mobility Hack-A-Thon 50. It was a great success, something that we will definitely be building on in the future. Aside from everyone else who paid attention and was interested in it, a big thank you to the over 170 people that registered and participated in this. A special congratulations to the top 10 teams who were selected as the top 10 ideas to solve Upward Mobility with technology or fintech. Last Tuesday, we went to the uptown Wake Forest Campus, and we had our judging panel go through those 10, and we crowned the top two teams that would move on to the finals who then went on Thursday of last week to our Venture 135 Conference, then after they pitched to over 300 people in the audience of investors, we crowned the team QC Upwards the champions, and there were amazing ideas from a CATS bus driver submitted an idea with no real technical background, things that she has seen that could make transportation easier on those in need of upward mobility to a group of students who just graduated a couple different high schools in town who saw that we have one guidance counselor to every 395 students and the average expectation is one to 250, and they worked on creating an apt that could kind of digitize that experience for a lot of students.

The two finalists team, the one that got second place was Gig Connected, who had a new way of thinking about how folks working in fields like construction and others could get...
paid easier and build up their own kind of resume to be able to do more jobs, but the winning team QC Upward was really great, a cross collaborative team that built literally, the only way I can describe it is like an overall operating system for everyone involved in social good across our community from the Men’s Shelter to Goodwill to the individual users and people who need to go to kiosk so that instead of working in silos in a very manual way we might be able to automate where the need is with word of supply. Very interesting future there and I appreciate everyone’s involvement.

Councilmember Newton said Happy Thanksgiving Charlotte.

Councilmember Egleston said we will get to heap praise on Councilmembers Harlow and Mayfield next Monday, but Councilmember Phipps will not be here. So, we shall heap on him now. On behalf of the entire Council I would like to pray for his lovely wife Lamare, for all the extra time she will have to put up with Gregg at home now. Best wishes Lamare; we are sorry but thank you for loaning him to us or putting him on us. I will miss my time with you Mr. Phipps and look forward to you hopefully coming around to visit every now and again.

Councilmember Harlow said this being the last Mayor and Council Topics, I just wanted to thank all my colleagues. I will say more about you all next week, but thank you all for these two-years and the staff, Mr. Manager and all your staff, this has been really a pleasure to be a part of. I have developed good working and personal relationships with all of you over this term and there are somethings I will miss and some things I won’t but none the less, to the community Happy Thanksgiving, be safe I’m thankful for all of you and the support you have given me on this Council and the work you do in our community to help build a better Charlotte. Thank you all, have a good holiday.

Councilmember Driggs said Councilmember Phipps, I wanted to echo what has been said. You have been a thoughtful and levelheaded presence on this Council, very valuable to us, and we will miss you. I just wanted to point out briefly, there will be a tree lighting ceremony at the Ballantyne Hotel next Sunday at 4:30 p.m. Everybody is invited, including this group, and otherwise, have a happy and safe holiday.

Councilmember Winston said this weekend I attended the NLC meeting in San Antonia and while I was there I sat in a session on a topic that we all have talked about repeatedly this year, Opportunity Zones. What becomes increasingly clear with every meeting I sit in on this topic is there is no best practice for municipalities to follow in terms of implementing an Opportunity Zone strategy or policy. We as a City have been doing a lot of good work to figure out what our strategy looks like and that work continues.

In laymen’s terms, Opportunity Zones are a federal program that incentivizes economic development by giving tax breaks on capital gains that opportunity funds invest in large amounts in neighborhoods that have been identified by state governments on behalf of municipal governments and counties. This program is a relationship between the tax payer and the IRS. We as a City do not have the ability to direct how investors invest, but we can create an overall strategy that will hopefully guide the type of development that we want to see.

There is much trepidation around Opportunity Zones; the rules are still being written on the federal level, so no-one knows the entirety of how this program will play out. Still investments are happening now; communities that have traditionally been marginalized by lack of investments have real concerns about the potential of gentrification and really displacement on steroids. On the other hand, there is a real possibility of the massive infusion of capital right now in areas that need it most.

If municipalities, counties, and states can work together to set the table in Opportunity Zones so we can correct some of the mistakes that we have made in the past. One of those tools I think we need is the ability to modulate property tax rates for existing homeowners in Opportunity Zones. The idea is that massive investment will expand tax revenues in these areas. With those increased revenues it is likely that overall tax values in the areas will increase. We know that this could lead to displacement. I would like to
ask our Economic Development and Intergovernmental Committees to explore how we can build coalitions around the state with other municipalities and counties to lobby our General Assembly for tools to modulate residential property taxes in Opportunity Zones.

Mayor Lyles said great idea. I think one, the Committee is already charged with coming up with a policy around how we implement Opportunity Zones, and that seems to be an excellent fit for it.

Mr. Driggs said I just wanted to point out that was a suggestion for our Committee referral. So, I don’t know whether we want to formalize it like that at this point.

Mayor Lyles said it has already been referred to the Committee.

Mr. Driggs said I would just say about that, we have discussed it, and I think the idea of creating a circular economy, how do you like this, a circular economy involving incremental tax receipts because of Opportunity Zone investments using some of those tax receipts to mitigate the unintended consequences. I don’t know if we will be able to mess with property tax rates; that should be on the table as well, but I do see a rational for trying to recycle some of those additional tax receipts into the Opportunity Zone.

Mayor Lyles said when Mr. Winston brought it up I said that there will be a number of things around property tax that sometimes are often included in our constitution or governed by the State, but there are ways that we can figure out. I know we are smart enough to figure out how to make that work for our City. So, thank you for bringing it up. It is in Committee and we will keep on working on it. and hopefully we will be able to do something that is a model for the rest of the country.

Councilmember Eiselt said first I just want to say that I will also miss our colleagues and want to take the opportunity this evening to say best of luck to Mr. Phipps, who is going on to other things. I guess he is not just going to sit at home and watch us on Monday night, so best of luck to you, and I will extend that to our colleagues next week for Ms. Mayfield and Dr. Harlow.

I also want to say Happy Thanksgiving to everyone, if you are traveling please travel safely. I hope your family and friends or whoever you are going to be gathering with also travels safely. If you want to have an opportunity to share fellowship with each other, there are two opportunities tomorrow; the first one is sponsored by Heal Charlotte, their fourth annual Thanksgiving dinner. It will be at the Salvation Army at 534 Spratt Street. They are going to be preparing the meals from 2:00 to 5:00 p.m. and then eating from 5:00 to 8:00 p.m., and they welcome you to come join us to do that or come and help serve or clean up or whatever it is that you would like to do to share in this Thanksgiving feast with the Heal Charlotte Group. Thank you to Gregg Jackson for organizing that; they plan on feeding 400 people. The other opportunity is the ninth annual Thanksgiving Giveback by Cops and Barbers. Shawn Corbit, the Lucky Spot Barber Shop and Cops and Barbers are going to be having what they are calling a Thanksgiving Feedback. So, come and join everyone and just have a meal together, that is going to be at the Betty Rae Rec Center, 2921 Tuckaseegee Road. It would be good if you could RSVP. We hope to see you there. Thank you and Happy Thanksgiving.

Mayor Lyles said I’m going to continue on the theme of thanks; last week when I talked about this community being so strong and grateful in so many ways and I just ask every resident to do what they could, and I had the opportunity to participate in three programs. First, I want to thank Latoya Williams and Chef James for serving over 250 people at Tuckaseeegee Rec Center on Saturday. I’d like to thank my own House of Worship, Friendship Missionary Baptist Church who will put new coats, a toy and a book for 7,000 children for this holiday season, making it possible for them to have something of note in their lives.

Then finally, the most fun day I had was lifting turkeys with John Demestihas, better known as Pow Boy Seafood on Freedom Drive, who gave away 600 turkey dinners to people in need, and it was one of the most joyous times that I’ve had to spend. When
you do good for others it is about you getting something back, more than you giving something out. It was a great Sunday and Saturday. These are individuals; they are not in any organization. They are not requiring anybody to come and do. They just make it happen, and I am grateful to live in a City like this that people do this kind of work for all of us. With that, Happy Thanksgiving to our community.

********

ADJOURNMENT

Motion was made by Councilmember Driggs, seconded by Councilmember Bokhari, and carried unanimously to adjourn the meeting.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:00 p.m.

Stephanie C. Kelly, City Clerk, MMC, NCCMC

Length of Meeting: 2 Hours, 55 Minutes
Minutes Completed: December 12, 2019