

**Governance & Accountability Committee**  
**Monday, September 22, 2014 – 12:00 noon**  
**Room 280**

Committee Members:       David Howard, Chair  
                                  LaWana Mayfield, Vice Chair  
                                  John Autry  
                                  Patsy Kinsey  
                                  Greg Phipps

Staff Resource:             Carol Jennings, Chief of Staff

---

**AGENDA**

**I.     City Manager and City Attorney Evaluation Process**

*Staff Resource: Ron Carlee, Bob Hagemann*

Action: The Committee will review and recommend to City Council the dimensions on which the City Manager and City Attorney will be evaluated in the coming year, including the work plan

**II.    Internal Audit Update**

*Staff Resource: Gregory McDowell, City Auditor*

Action: The City Auditor will review the rollout of the Employee Hotline

**IV.   Ethics Overview**

*Staff Resource: Bob Hagemann*

**IV.   Next Meeting**

**\*\*Monday, October 27, 2014 at 12:00 noon in Room 280**

The Committee will assess the effectiveness of the evaluation process and provide recommendations to the Mayor/Council for revision

**Distribution:**

Mayor and City Council  
Council Team  
Greg McDowell  
Sheila Simpson

City Manager's Executive Team  
Bob Hagemann  
Cheryl Brown  
Robert Campbell

Corporate Communications  
Stephanie Kelly

**Ron Carlee**  
**2014-2015 Proposed Performance Objectives**  
**Developed June 22, 2014**  
**Revised September 18, 2014 2014**

1. ***Build Community*** consistent with the Mayor and Council's articulated vision, values, and focus area strategies. Ensure that Charlotte is greater than the sum of its parts, a "community of intent" – where people choose to live, work, or visit. A globally recognized and respected community where people are connected, engaged, and informed. Build collaborative relationships with other governmental units, the business community, and other institutions.
  - Work with Mayor/Council to take visioning work to the next level.
  - Re-evaluate the structure and programs of Neighborhood and Business Services to ensure that there truly is a focus on neighborhoods. Either reinstate the Neighborhood Symposium or develop an alternative proposal to bring neighborhood representatives together to network and to develop relationships with City staff.
  - Agree on a data dashboard for measuring the City's progress.
  - Present concrete plans for targeted neighborhood development in ways that support and nurture the neighborhoods.
  - Clarify vision and plan for transit-oriented development on Lynx Blue Line Extension.
  - Develop recommendations for defining and acting on the goal of "global competitiveness."
  - Present recommendations for redevelopment projects such as Eastland Mall, the Bojangle's property and the Charlotte Gateway Transit.
  
2. ***Provide Operational Leadership*** ensuring that City services are provided consistent with the policy direction of the Mayor and Council as expressed through the adopted annual operating and capital budgets and other plans. Engage and respond to the public with strong customer relations. Demonstrate efficiency and effectiveness. Provide stewardship in financial management, protecting the City's triple-A bond rating and financial resilience. Promote innovation and leading practices.
  - Demonstrate the sustainability of the capital program; develop recommendations for contingent capacity; secure triple-A bond rating for any general obligation issuances.
  - Provide a sustainable operating budget adjusting for impacts of legislative action or inaction related to the Business Privilege License Tax.
  - Develop recommendations for stable and sustainable maintenance of the water/sewer system.
  - Develop recommendations for a credible and sustainable storm water program.
  - Ensure the continued success of the aviation department during its transition.
  - Implement a revised Balanced Scorecard program.
  - Adopt new guidelines on procuring professional services and on contract change orders and extensions.
  - Integrate financial and planning services based on leading practices to ensure coordination with appropriate check and balances.

**3. *Promote Effective Relationships with the Mayor & Council*** *providing non-partisan, fair, equitable, and constructive support to each elected official, positioning the governing body to succeed as a whole. Foster trust, respect, honesty, collaboration and openness. Work with the Mayor and Council to define problems and focus desired outcomes. Provide timely communication on major projects, initiatives and critical incidents.*

- Be more communicative with Council. Meet individually with each Council member at least once a month. Stay in on-going communications with Council on an equitable basis, ensuring that all Council Members have access and the same information.
- Clarify policy issues with Council when the Council position is ambiguous or the Council is split. Do not get ahead of Council in public discussions. Ensure consistency in public comments with Council policy.
- Review staffing for Council Committees to clarify the staff's role and to ensure that Council Members are setting their own agendas and driving their work plans. Work with staff as needed to be more open to creative and alternative ways for approaching policy issues rather than starting with why something cannot be done. Help the Council get to "yes" where the Council so chooses, exploring leading practices and creativity.
- Keep Council informed of emerging issues.
- Work with Council to ensure meaningful retreats and workshops.
- Ensure measureable progress on the Council's Focus Area Plans.
- Ensure that all Council Members understand the role of Council's staff members. Make adjustments as need to meet the needs of Council.
- Work with the Council Budget Committee to evaluate last year's budget process so that the Committee can make recommendations to Council with regard to any process changes, including the role of the Budget Committee.

**4. *Develop the City government's Workforce*** *such that Charlotte is an employer of intent, where people feel valued and appreciated. Recommend and implement a compensation system that is internally fair and externally competitive. Promote internal values that create a positive work climate and culture. Recruit and retain high performing workforce that is reflective of the community. Ensure development at all levels of the organization.*

- Implement revised policy on ethics (including gifts and gratuities) and enhanced disclosure.
- Recommend a fair and sustainable compensation plan appropriate for field workers.
- Assess turnover and employee morale. Explore improvements to ensure smooth succession as people retire or leave.
- Review the City's EEO/AA goals and accomplishments.
- Review the safety record of the City and take actions to reduce preventable accidents and worker injury.
- Expand the use of multi-rater reviews for managers and executives.
- Update the policies for disciplinary action including dismissal to ensure organizational consistency and compliance with all local and federal laws related to fair treatment and non-discrimination.

5. ***Engage in professional development, participating in at least 40 hours of professional, technical, and/or managerial training and education. Participate in and provide leadership in regional, state, and national professional organizations in order to (a) keep current on emerging trends and leading practices; (b) build intergovernmental partnerships; and (c) showcase Charlotte as a local government leaders and globally competitive city.***

**Professional Development Plan for 2014 as Submitted to ICMA's Credentialing Program**

- Personal Development. Model leadership by asserting more self-discipline through time management, diet, and exercise. Participate in group wellness activities, attend relevant sessions at conferences, use wellness tools available on-line and promote the same with immediate staff and across the organization.
- Strategic Planning. Develop clearer approach to strategic planning and implementation through a deeper understanding on the theory and practice of the balanced scorecard in the public environment and its integration with vision, values, and operational planning. Attend relevant sessions at conferences, engage in self and group study, and use third party consultation.
- Staff Effectiveness & Personal Development. Continue the exploration of self/group awareness tools to build a highly performing team, including the Work Place Big 5 and EQi. Participate in group learning, independent reading, training sessions, and third party consultation.
- Staff Effectiveness & Personal Development. Use a multi-rater assessment consistent with guidelines for a Credentialed Manager.
- Other Professional Activities Planned: ICMA Annual Conference; North Carolina City/County Management Association summer & winter conferences; Large City Executive Forum summer & winter conferences; NC League of Municipalities annual meeting; NLC spring conference; Chamber Inter-City Visit and/or annual retreat.

6. ***Manage special projects and/or high - priority issues anticipated.***

- Neighborhood Redevelopment -- assuming voter approval of bonds, implement community investment program in ways that have transformational neighborhood impact, promoting private investment.
- Charlotte Business Inclusion Program – provide an assessment and recommendations as may be appropriate to enhance effectiveness of inclusion program, including the appropriate organizational placement of the program.
- Façade and Security Improvements Program – develop recommendations for expansion of use as part of neighborhood redevelopment
- Arena Negotiations – complete negotiations consistent with the City's contractual commitments and in a manner that is fiscally responsible.
- Immigrant Integration Task Force – monitor work of task force and its recommendations in order to ensure a community that is welcoming and accepting of people with diverse backgrounds.

- Mecklenburg Livable Communities Plan – ensure City participation in the plan, make policy recommendations, and take administrative actions to integrate the plan into the City’s strategic structures.
- Joint Communications Center – implement construction of the facility in a manner that responsibly meets the City’s emergency management needs and in a manner that contributes to redevelopment.
- Solid Waste Long-Term Plan – develop a long-range plan that provides dependable service and advances conservation and recycling.
- Corporate Communications – develop more effective use of mobile and social media to effectively tell the City’s story and interact with our different publics; ensure that departments have community engagement strategies.
- Permitting and inspections—coordinate with the County to facilitate development consistent with plans and policies.
- Historic Districts—implement policies and procedures for more effectively ensuring the protection of historic properties.
- Coal Ash—implement Council action and ensure protection of the City’s water and air quality.
- Airport Taxi Contract – work with the Aviation Director and others to ensure a fair and competitive process that provides opportunity to as many taxis as the level of business can support and as can be effectively managed to ensure strong customer relations.

## **Attachment A. Quantitative Measures Related to Council Adopted Performance Criteria**

The concept behind this section is to develop a set of quantitative metrics that monitor the overall progress of the city and the city government organization toward meeting its vision and goals. This is a new component to the City Manager's evaluation and should be considered a work in progress.

**Build Community** Performance measures. The purpose of these measures is to assess whether or not we are building the type of community we want, i.e., achieving our vision. These measures should feed into the Council's Focus Areas.

- a. Citizen Satisfaction Surveys – the national citizen survey conducted this past year provides baseline data on the extent to which the people of Charlotte are satisfied with their city and connected to one another. Overall, the results for Charlotte are generally consistent with other cities with a population over 200,000, for which we have comparative data. Important measures include the public's perceptions on the following:
  1. Overall quality of life
  2. Charlotte as a place to live
  3. Their own neighborhood
  4. Overall image of Charlotte
  5. Charlotte's economic health
  6. Overall feeling of safety
  7. Contact with the City
  8. Overall built environment
  9. Sense of community
  10. Openness and acceptance of people with different backgrounds
  11. Engagement measures
  12. Trust in city government
  
- b. Quality of Life Data – the city has compiled an impressive volume of data at the neighborhood level, which is easily accessible on the city's web site. There are 8 dimensions and 80 variables reported. The data are not, however, aggregated so that we can see the totals for the whole city and the strategy to use the data to drive results is not developed. Among the measures that are important overall are the following:
  1. Diversity of population
  2. Proximity to transit
  3. Property values
  4. Household income
  5. Employment
  6. Business diversity
  7. Education
  8. Crime
  9. Code Violations
  10. Housing Diversity

We will also examine other benchmarking efforts for consideration for adoption and participation. For example, the International Organization for Standardization (ISO) in Geneva has recently listed 46 indicators for cities (See Attachment B). They cover the areas of economy, education, energy, environment, finance, fire and emergency services, governance, health, safety, shelter, solid waste, telecommunication & innovation, transportation, urban planning, waste water, and water & sanitation.

- c. Charlotte's ranking with other top tier cities – this is a new effort that will evolve over the next year. We will undertake to identify third parties that rank cities and understand their methodology for doing so. We will then assess Charlotte's ranking, identify areas where we want to rank higher, and develop strategies to do so. These include such areas as walkability, trees, biking, economic opportunity, and income disparity. See Attachment C. City Rankings.
- d. Civic Engagement metrics – this is also a work in progress. A number of approaches have been used to measure civic engagement, but none that are yet generally accepted.

**Operational Leadership** Performance Measures. These measures are intended to ask these questions about City services: How well are we doing? How do we know? In addition to the measures bellow, ICMA has recently developed a partnership with SAS, located in Cary, NC to launch a new performance benchmarking program, which we will be monitoring and assessing.

- a. Balanced Scorecard results for City departments – we're in the process of re-examining this program for the development of more relevant measures that help drive performance.
- b. Customer satisfaction surveys – this includes the citizen's survey that contains essentially a report card on city services. We will link it to other critical customer measurements that are collected by city departments.
- c. Assessments by the external and internal auditors; evaluations by the bond rating agencies – minimum requirements are a clean annual external audit and maintaining bond general obligation and revenue bond ratings.
- d. Awards and recognition of city services – we will begin to systematically collect recognition by third parties and report them together.

**Mayor & Council Relationships** Performance measures. These measure address the relationship between the manager and the elected body.

- a. Assessments by the Mayor & Council
- b. Responsiveness to Mayor & Council requests
- c. Proactive strategies to communicate to the Mayor & Council.

**City government's Workforce** Performance Measures. These measures assess the effectiveness of developing a motivated and productive workforce.

- a. Employee culture & climate surveys – our first survey will be conducted in the coming months and will establish our baseline.
- b. Subordinate feedback – This data will be specific executive performance of the city manager of other executives.

- c. Turnover, retention, and affirmative action measures – HR will develop key measures that will be tracked over time.
- d. Employee development measures – these measures will document efforts to provide development opportunity for employees and assess its effectiveness.
- e. Wellness & safety measures – data will come from our health plans and from risk management.

## **Attachment B. ISO City Data Standards**

### **Economy**

- City's unemployment rate
- Assessed value of commercial and industrial properties as a percentage of total assessed value of all properties
- Percentage of city population living in poverty

### **Education**

- Percentage of female school-aged population enrolled in school
- Percentage of students completing primary education
- Percentage of students completing secondary education
- Primary education student/teacher ratio

### **Energy**

- Total residential electrical use per capita (kWh/year)
- Percentage of city population with authorized electrical service
- Energy consumption of public buildings per year (kWh/m<sup>2</sup>)
- Percentage of total energy derived from renewable sources, as a share of the city's total energy consumption

### **Environment**

- Fine particulate matter (PM<sub>2.5</sub>) concentration
- Particulate matter (PM<sub>10</sub>) concentration
- Greenhouse gas emissions measured in tonnes per capita

### **Finance**

- Debt service ratio (debt service expenditure as a percent of a municipality's own-source revenue)

### **Fire and emergency response**

- Number of firefighters per 100 000 population
- Number of fire related deaths per 100 000 population
- Number of natural disaster-related deaths per 100 000 population

### **Governance**

- Voter participation in last municipal election (as a percentage of eligible voters)
- Women as a percentage of total elected to city-level office

### **Health**

- Average life expectancy
- Number of in-patient hospital beds per 100 000 population
- Number of physicians per 100 000 population
- Under age five mortality per 1 000 live births

**Safety**

- Number of police officers per 100 000 population
- Number of homicides per 100 000 population

**Shelter**

- Percentage of city population living in slums

**Solid waste**

- Percentage of city population with regular solid waste collection (residential)
- Total collected municipal solid waste per capita
- Percentage of city's solid waste that is recycled

**Telecommunication and Innovation**

- Number of internet connections per 100 000 population
- Number of cell phone connections per 100 000 population

**Transportation**

- Km of high capacity public transport system per 100 000 population
- Km of light passenger transport system per 100 000 population
- Annual number of public transport trips per capita
- Number of personal automobiles per capita

**Urban Planning**

- Green area (hectares) per 100 000 population

**Wastewater**

- Percentage of city population served by wastewater collection
- Percentage of the city's wastewater that has received no treatment
- Percentage of the city's wastewater receiving primary treatment
- Percentage of the city's wastewater receiving secondary treatment
- Percentage of the city's wastewater receiving tertiary treatment

**Water and Sanitation**

- Percentage of city population with potable water supply service
- Percentage of city population with sustainable access to an improved water source
- Percentage of population with access to improved sanitation
- Total domestic water consumption per capita (litres/day)

See more at: <http://citiscopes.org/story/2014/here-are-46-performance-measures-worlds-cities-will-be-judged#sthash.jsVmosye.dpuf>

## Attachment C. City Rankings

### Representative Samples – Research in Progress

---

#### Civic Life: Participates in Public Meetings

**Rank:** 3<sup>rd</sup> out of 50 Large Cities with 13.7% participation

**Source:** The Corporation for National and Community Service (CNCS), an independent federal agency <http://www.volunteeringinamerica.gov>

**Additional Information:** The data for this website were collected through two supplements to the Current Population Survey (CPS); the Volunteer Supplement and the Civic Supplement. The CPS is a monthly survey of about 60,000 households, (approximately 100,000 adults) conducted by the U.S. Census Bureau for the Bureau of Labor Statistics. The selected supplements collect data on the volunteering, voting, and civic activities of adults age 16 and older for volunteering and 18 and older for the civic supplement. Volunteers are considered individuals who performed unpaid volunteer activities through or for an organization at any point during the 12-month period, from September 1 of the prior year through the survey week in September of the survey year  
\* Appendix A

---

#### Civic Life: Active in Neighborhood

**Ranking:** 6<sup>th</sup> out of 50 with 12.3% active

**Source:** The Corporation for National and Community Service (CNCS), an independent federal agency  
<http://www.volunteeringinamerica.gov>

**Additional Information:** The data for this website were collected through two supplements to the Current Population Survey (CPS); the Volunteer Supplement and the Civic Supplement. The CPS is a monthly survey of about 60,000 households, (approximately 100,000 adults) conducted by the U.S. Census Bureau for the Bureau of Labor Statistics. The selected supplements collect data on the volunteering, voting, and civic activities of adults age 16 and older for volunteering and 18 and older for the civic supplement. Volunteers are considered individuals who performed unpaid volunteer activities through or for an organization at any point during the 12-month period, from September 1 of the prior year through the survey week in September of the survey year

---

## Upward Mobility

**Ranking:** 50th (last) out of 50 Cities

**Source:** A 2014 study published by the National Bureau of Economic Research  
[http://obs.rc.fas.harvard.edu/chetty/mobility\\_geo.pdf](http://obs.rc.fas.harvard.edu/chetty/mobility_geo.pdf)

**Additional Information:** We use administrative records on the incomes of more than 40 million children and their parents to describe three features of intergenerational mobility in the United States. While the study did not determine causal relationships, high mobility areas had (1) less residential segregation, (2) less income inequality, (3) better primary schools, (4) greater social capital, and (5) greater family stability.

---

### Safest Cities in America (Population 500,000 or more)

**Ranking:** 8th

**Source:** Infoplease.com, part of Pearson, the world's largest Education company  
[Safest and Most Dangerous U.S. Cities, 2013 | Infoplease.com](http://www.infoplease.com/us/cities/safest-dangerous-cities.html#ixzz34SCq92LK) <http://www.infoplease.com/us/cities/safest-dangerous-cities.html#ixzz34SCq92LK>

**Additional Information:** The rankings are based on a city's rate for six crime categories: murder, rape, robbery, aggravated assault, burglary, and motor vehicle theft.

---

### America's New Opportunity Cities

**Rank:** 3<sup>rd</sup> out of Metropolitan Areas with over 1 million residents

**Source:** Demographer William Frey of the Brookings Institution for Yahoo Finance  
<http://finance.yahoo.com/news/america-s-new-opportunity-cities-222209099.html>

**Additional Information:** Census Bureau data was analyzed to determine internal migration trends among big metropolitan areas with more than 1 million residents. His data exclude population growth due to birth or death rates or the immigration of foreigners, so they reveal which big cities working-age Americans are leaving and flocking to. Here are the 10 newest opportunity cities drawing workers looking for better jobs and a higher standard of living.

---

### Health and Community Fitness

**Ranking:** 27<sup>th</sup> out of 50 Metropolitan areas

**Source:** ACSM (The American College of Sports Medicine)  
[http://americanfitnessindex.org/docs/reports/acsm\\_2014AFI\\_report\\_final.pdf](http://americanfitnessindex.org/docs/reports/acsm_2014AFI_report_final.pdf)

**Additional Information:** The American Fitness Index reflects a composite of personal health measures, preventive health behaviors, levels of chronic disease conditions, as well as environmental and community resources and policies that support physical activity, including parks, recreation centers, etc.



## Most Sprawling Large Metro Areas 2014

**Ranking:** 5<sup>th</sup> worst (or 197<sup>th</sup> out of 220)

**Source:** Smart Growth America

<http://www.smartgrowthamerica.org/documents/measuring-sprawl-2014.pdf>

**Additional Information:** Large metro areas are defined as having a population more than one million.

Development in both MSAs and metropolitan counties was evaluated using four main factors: 1) development density; 2) land use mix; 3) activity centering; and 4) street accessibility. These four factors are combined in equal weight and controlled for population to calculate each area's Sprawl Index score. The average index is 100, meaning areas with scores higher than 100 tend to be more compact and connected and areas with scores lower than 100 are more sprawling.

---

## Best Cities to Start a Business (2014)

**Ranking:** 18<sup>th</sup> out of the 50 largest US cities

**Source:** Nerdwallet.com

<http://www.nerdwallet.com/blog/cities/economics/best-cities-start-business>

**Additional Information:** The following factors were examined: access to funding, human capital, local economy, business-friendliness, and affordability.

---

## Urban Road Conditions

**Ranking:** 19<sup>th</sup> out of 75 with 17% of roads ranked as poor, 27% of roads ranked as mediocre, 17% of roads ranked as fair, 40% of roads ranked as good

**Source:** TRIP, a nonprofit organization that researches, evaluates and distributes economic and technical data on highway transportation issues

[http://www.tripnet.org/docs/Urban\\_Roads\\_Report\\_Oct\\_2013.pdf](http://www.tripnet.org/docs/Urban_Roads_Report_Oct_2013.pdf)

**Additional Information:** In this report, an urban area includes the major city in a region and its neighboring or surrounding suburban areas. Pavement condition data are the latest available and are derived from the Federal Highway Administration's (FHWA) 2011 annual survey of state transportation officials on the condition of major state and locally maintained roads and highways, based on a uniform pavement rating index. The pavement rating index measures the level of smoothness of pavement surfaces, supplying information on the ride quality provided by road and highway surfaces.

---

## Best-Performing Cities

**Ranking:** 27<sup>th</sup> out of 200 cities (up from 35<sup>th</sup>)

**Source:** The Milken Institute Index 2013

<http://www.best-cities.org/bestcities.taf?rankyear=2013&type=Large-Cities-Rankings>

**Additional Information:** The Institute ranks U.S. metropolitan areas by how well they are creating and sustaining jobs and economic growth. The components include job, wage and salary, and technology growth. In most years, these give a good indication of the underlying structural performance of regional economics.

---

## Walkability

**Rank:** 138<sup>th</sup> out of 141 with a score of 24.4

**Source:** <http://www.walkscore.com>

**Additional Information:** Walk Score measures the walkability of any address using a patent-pending system. For each address, Walk Score analyzes hundreds of walking routes to nearby amenities. Points are awarded based on the distance to amenities in each category. Amenities within a 5 minute walk (.25 miles) are given maximum points. A decay function is used to give points to more distant amenities, with no points given after a 30 minute walk. Walk Score also measures pedestrian friendliness by analyzing population density and road metrics such as block length and intersection density. Data sources include Google, Education.com, Open Street Map, the U.S. Census, Localeze, and places added by the Walk Score user community.

90–100	<i>Walker's Paradise</i> Daily errands do not require a car.
70–89	<i>Very Walkable</i> Most errands can be accomplished on foot.
50–69	<i>Somewhat Walkable</i> Some errands can be accomplished on foot.
25–49	<i>Car-Dependent</i> Most errands require a car.
0–24	<i>Car-Dependent</i> Almost all errands require a car.

**Robert Hagemann**  
**2014-2015 Proposed Performance Objectives**

**1. Advise the Mayor and City Council**

Provide high quality legal advice. When, as is often the case, the law is uncertain, advise as such and be creative in identifying and developing options and solutions that will assist rather than frustrate the Council in achieving its objectives. Understand that legal risk is but one of many factors for the Council to consider in making its policy decisions. Respond to requests for advice or assistance from elected officials in a timely, unbiased, and non-partisan fashion. Be accessible to and meet as needed with elected officials. Treat the Mayor and each member of City Council in a fair and equitable manner.

**2. Represent the City's Interests**

Professionally and aggressively defend legal challenges to Council decisions and actions of the City and its employees while treating the court, members of the bar, and our citizens with courtesy and respect. If the City has legally wronged a citizen, seek a resolution that is both fair to the citizen and protective of the taxpayer. Clearly and courteously explain the City's legal position to citizens and the media.

**3. Assist the City Manager and Staff**

Advise the City Manager and his staff as a member of the team. This day-to-day work ranges from providing legal opinions to creatively and collaboratively identifying and developing options for carrying out Council and Manager directives, policy initiatives, and providing effective service to our citizens.

**4. Manage the City Attorney's Office**

Develop an effective and efficient organization. Recruit and retain a competent and diverse staff. Promote opportunities for professional and career development of the attorneys and staff. Address personnel issues in a direct and timely manner.

**5. Professional Development**

Stay abreast of changes and developments in state and federal law, whether through judicial decisions, legislative enactments, or administrative rule-making and interpretation. Engage with the bar and professional organizations. Attend relevant Continuing Legal Education programs.