



Charlotte City Council
Council – Manager Relations Committee
Summary
October 31, 2012

**COMMITTEE AGENDA
TOPICS**

- I. City Manager Recruitment Process
- II. Next Meeting

COMMITTEE INFORMATION

Councilmembers Present: Mayor Foxx, Warren Cooksey, James Mitchell, David Howard, Patsy Kinsey, Patrick Cannon

Staff Resources: Cheryl Brown, Carol Jennings, David Sanders

Audience: Robert Hagemann, Kim McMillan, Tracy Montross

Meeting Duration: 11:00am – 1:00pm

DISCUSSION HIGHLIGHTS

Foxx	How do we establish the relationship with search firm?
Brown	They report to you, they are the central point of contact, they collect the applicant data, and determine who to bring to you.
Foxx	What kind of filter do they use?
Brown	Applicants are filtered based on knowledge, skills and ability.
Sanders	They will also have knowledge of the candidates they have pursued, they will be current City Managers/Asst. City Managers typically, therefore they will have extensive information on them.
Foxx	I want to make sure the process gives us the best possible choices. As some members may have particular candidates in mind.
Sanders	They will do a national search; look across the country for who can do this work.
Brown	We are clear with the search firm about our goals, they will bring us a sizable pool that may or may not include internals.

Foxx Will internals apply the same way as external candidates?

Brown Yes.

Foxx How does the firm know what we are looking for?

Sanders From talking with you and Council.

Foxx So we tell search firm what we want and they base their filter on that?

Brown Yes

Foxx Looking at additional detail on searches and comparing that with the larger Council-Manager Cities in the country, Waters has done some, but I'm surprised I don't see more.

Brown Waters does not list all their searches, we can find out additional information.

Foxx That would be helpful. I don't recall what the firm did along the lines of coming back to us in the past with the profile.

Sanders The Job Description and the Profile were given to the Council for approval last time, this time the description and the profile will be together.

McMillan Our team helped distribute surveys and used the website to collect input. We will assist the firm however they ask us to work in the process.

Sanders We, the staff, are your eyes and ears to manage the search firm. We make sure the final product gets to where you want to go; in the last process we collected citizen input, business leader input; Mayor and Council input; and a random list of employees also gave input.

Howard How was that used?

Jennings To aid you in the interview process.

Brown Also to help narrow your choices.

Howard At what point do you share info with candidates?

Sanders We have put the profile out on website.

McMillan The public has access to the information.

Foxx I have been in a couple situations for executive searches, it is unusual that the search firm would not have a reporting relationship to the board itself. Worried about in a process like this the need for confidentiality, hard when staff is in the middle, however we need your help.

Brown Where does our involvement make you uncomfortable?

Foxx For example, say there are 5 internal candidates, they are out there talking and then external candidates talking...worried staff is watching process and leaking information.

Mitchell To follow up on the profile, I think we are at a different place in 2012, how long does take staff to gather info...worried about using 2007 profile.

Brown The information will change based on the input received.

Mitchell This will not be created till later?

Brown Yes

Foxx Read the difference between 2 calendars. Option 1 and Option 2.

Mitchell and Foxx and Howard I like 2

Cooksey What do we know about Bob Murray and Associates who did searches for Phoenix and San Antonio, were they on our radar?

Brown No sir.

Cooksey I'm curious, James ,what were you looking at changing on profile?

Mitchell I don't see "experience transforming a City; being a visionary".

Cooksey (Mr. Cooksey read several key phrases from the profile)

Mitchell I didn't see visionary; fast growing city.

Cooksey Just wondered what would change...this one is a broad net that could be cast, my HR experience is limited, but afraid more detailed profile would limit us.

Mitchell I am saying the profile should be the key things we want in new leader.

Cooksey I'm afraid if more is listed it may cause applicants possibly not to apply.

Mitchell Past example – had 114 apps but Council only saw 17. Felt out of the loop. Didn't feel had enough influence getting to the 17, I want to be more engaged

Brown We will receive a lot of applications and it is the firm's job to filter. But we can request you to have more input.

Sanders Whatever you want done, we will execute. Not sure of all that happened in past as to why you only saw a limited amount.

Kinsey Profile – we need to move on to meet our time schedule.
I understand search firm will change the profile.
Resumes – I like to look at resumes but we have a full council and if everyone starts looking then will be a lot of varying favorites. It is a chore and if you don't know what you are looking for, it's difficult. I would not want it open to everyone looking at resumes.

Howard Mayor what will help with your concerns? Maybe it is the Mayor getting involved with the firm and the Council asking the Mayor questions.

Kinsey That would not set well with other members of the Council.

Sanders The only staff involved in the process is the HR director and me. We will work directly with Search firm, we collect info from site. Does that help with confidentiality concerns?

Howard The staff, search firm, Council. Okay with Foxx being involved and bringing back info.

Mitchell That will put Mayor in bad situation. Maybe present more of a summary than details. As a member who was not in the loop last time, I felt slighted. We need to be this time upfront with summary info of applicants, so people know that we as a Council are involved.

Kinsey HR can make info available to any of Council members?

Sanders It is not public info but we can make it available to Council members.

Howard Maybe this committee could be more involved and open to other Council members. I want to feel involved.

Foxx Discussion difficult, there are 12 decision makers, no single decision maker. Process is this way because staff has tried to help us, but if we want to exercise more time in process that opens up a can of worms as to whether we stay on track and opens confidentiality issues, not saying anything against you all. Need to keep a two way conversation between council and search firm.

Howard The search firms in white (on the form) did Council narrow to these 3?

Foxx Yes. The Council was more positive about Waters, and there was not enough info about Spencer Stewart.

Mitchell NC league worked with Springsted.

Jennings People will know Charlotte is a City to apply for, we feel we will have strong applications, Charlotte is a top city in population and form of government.

Kinsey We could search for firm forever, looking at these, I keep going back to Waters, suggest Waters. I move to go with Waters.

Howard If headhunters talk bad that can affect our pool of candidates, a good firm is needed.

Brown The search firm will actively go out and contact people across county. Knowing Charlotte is open, some seekers will contact the firm.

Howard We need a firm sophisticated enough to talk to applicants.

Foxx Who the firm knows is necessary.

Cannon I'm excited. There will be a lot of excitement on Charlotte, based on how well the firm will represent us.

Kinsey Waters worked with us before.

Cooksey Size of a city is not the only factor; we need to look at what the City Manager manages. Pure population is not the only factor. Some cities have park and recreation and library responsibilities.

Foxx Not sure other cities manage what we do. Size not equal to issues.

Howard Trying to move conversation on, we need to pick one or ask for more.

Kinsey Reminder we are dealing with a Professional HR department. I think if there were other Search firms out there we would have seen them. Ok to move forward.

Mitchell Waters placed our Police Chief, they know our environment. Looking at fees, not large difference. I can support Waters.

Foxx Staff – If Council were to hire X firm and then say candidate identity info would be confidential, does that interrupt process

Sanders Our main thrust is to make sure the firm provides what you want and we need to make sure they are doing their job all along the way. The first step – make sure your profile is the way you requested.

Foxx You guys can ensure the quality of the firm, how does that work?

Brown We can help, the firm will compile the info and we work with them to make sure it's in an acceptable form. We are more on the logistical side and we don't want to be overly involved as this will be my new boss. In a search, HR knows who applies but has no influence in the narrowing of candidates.

Sanders That is accurate; we just make sure they have a product for you.

Kinsey I understand Mayor, but don't see how can be done without HR, We can't do this. Worked before and don't see how can do otherwise. I understand your concern.

Foxx We can't do logistics, but the Candidate pool, if we don't like it, we tell firm go back.

Sanders Correct.

Howard Did the Mayor narrow down in past?

Sanders No, the Mayor did make sure we contacted the people in the business community to interview.

Howard I don't see difference with Mayor being involved with process. Then he can take his thoughts to Council.

Foxx The decision is more important than me being in the middle. Think it is hard for Council to be totally involved. I am trying to say, we set this process up, but every step Council needs to be notified, then we have the ability to say the process is open and transparent.

Howard Maybe we add to the motion that the Mayor is involved in process, Mayor updates Council.

Foxx I don't think the full council would agree, I appreciate confidence in me. Think we just need to keep at Council level. And keep confidentially of pool between Council and Search Firm. HR not know the candidates, they just do logistics.

Kinsey I absolutely trust HR staff.

Cooksey There are 12 votes including Mayor, they are all equal votes.

Howard Foxx Not saying Mayor makes decisions, just someone who represents Council.
Are there any other reasons why the identity of candidates should be made known to HR?

Sanders We are charged with the confidentiality of Candidates of any job, We ensure that when the media calls that info is not provided. Never provided info regarding applicant names in the past.

Cooksey What impact in your work with the search firm would change if HR did not know name of applicants – How would the way you were planning to work change?

Brown I've never worked a process in this manner, so I don't know of implications of not knowing the names.

Howard I have no confidence in staying confidential with firm and Council. Someone needs to manage.

Foxx Kinsey That's a bigger issue; should be confidential among Council.
I agree that confidentiality with Council is hard, especially with media. We need to trust in HR.

Cannon Past experience – we did well with confidentiality till got down to the 3 but by that time candidates were primed. No issues.

Brown McMillan Our job is to protect candidates.
Biggest challenges, media in other cities reporting on their folks coming here for interviews.

Sanders Foxx If we don't know who candidates are, we can't protect them.
There's a motion on table to move ahead with firm, even though I don't know a lot, I do continue to have concerns over our expectations. I'm not supporting motion because of concerns with confidentiality. Think Council needs to take more of a hand in process. Afraid of inertia of internal candidates –
Committee voted 4 for, 1 to recommend the search firm of Waters (Kinsey, Cooksey, Howard and Mitchell voted yes; Foxx voted no)

Mitchell Cooksey I make a motion to select Option 2 (Schedule of Activities and Calendar)
On Proposal 1, making the announcement at Retreat...Manager not present, how does that work without a Manager present talking about Budget process. Don't like either option. Who are we providing guidance to at retreat?

Howard Cooksey Foxx Mitchell Cooksey Foxx The manager will have to come in and take up what we decide.
But who are we providing guidance too?
The interim City Manager.
We select the retreat date, we can change the date since it is in town.
Either go with City Manager coming into the middle of the budget or after the fact.
Historically the departure date of the manager went with end of budget – this manager will be leaving in the middle. I am worried that we will send someone into a fight. Feel like we need to get our house in order.
Committee voted 3 to 2 in favor of proposal 2 (Foxx, Howard and Mitchell voted yes; Kinsey and Cooksey voted no)

Foxx Jennings Howard Jennings Cannon Can we ask staff to look at retreat dates after March 6th?
We can do that.
How does the interim work?
We don't have on the schedule the appointment of an interim. I'm thinking we need to put that on the calendar.
Something to consider - we do not know what internals will apply. Need to know of

any in-house candidates before we select an interim.
Howard We know there is an interim, would like to see that appointment before Walton leaves.
Jennings Council could go into executive session on Nov 26th, Dec 10 or Dec 17 to discuss appointment of interim manager.
Kinsey Would this come to this Committee first?
Foxx No, Council as a whole.
Motion made to go into closed session was approved unanimously
Committee came out of closed session.
Committee voted unanimously that the interim manager not be a candidate for City Manager.
Foxx Would like to see the terms with search firm.

Committee set its next meeting date on Monday November 5 at 8:30 a.m.